The Waikato Islamic Studies Review aims to attract new researchers and established scholars interested in the subject of Islam as an academic discipline and to provide an opportunity to discuss and exchange information and knowledge on new research in the form of a ‘working paper’ publication.

The Waikato Islamic Studies Review invites submissions on any topic or theme, including religion, philosophy, history, politics, sociology, culture, and law, within the broad field of studies on Islam and Muslim societies.

Submission Format & Process

All papers must comply with the following requirements and authors are responsible for securing copyright permission to reproduce any figure, table, or text from another source.

*Papers are to be formatted in Microsoft Office Word, Front: 12 Times New Roman

*Minimum of 2000 & a maximum of 5000 words in length

*Footnote or Endnote citations

*An abstract & short author note

*Papers are to be submitted electronically at: islamic-studies-group@waikato.ac.nz

All submissions will be considered
# Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Author(s)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Journalists Under the Islamic Law of Armed Conflict: In Theory and Practice</td>
<td>Hector Sharp</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>Towards a Final Combination: Muhammad Iqbal’s Philosophy of History (Part II)</td>
<td>Carimo Mohomed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36</td>
<td>Initial Literary Responses to 9/11: Less About Politics than Religion</td>
<td>Somayyeh Ghaffari and Kim Worthington</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>55</td>
<td>The Contributions of Shaykh Aliyu Harazimi to the Production of Islamic Manuscripts</td>
<td>Auwalu Muhammad Hassan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>72</td>
<td>Fiqh Al-Aqalliyyah Between Texts and Neo-Ijtihad in Modern Legal Studies: A Case Study of Igbo Muslim Minorities</td>
<td>Kazeem Adekunle Adegoke</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Views expressed in this publication are the authors and not necessarily those of the University of Waikato Islamic Studies Group
Journalists Under the Islamic Law of Armed Conflict: In Theory and Practice

Hector Sharp

Hector Sharp is an LLM candidate at the Geneva Academy of International Humanitarian Law and Human Rights. He holds a BA in Political Science and International Relations focusing on Middle Eastern studies and a Juris Doctor from the University of Melbourne. Originally from New Zealand, he worked as a journalist in the Middle East in the aftermath of the Arab Spring covering events in Syria, Lebanon, Israel and the Occupied Territories, Egypt, and Sudan. Subsequently, Hector practiced law at a global law firm in Dubai before moving to Geneva for his return to studies.

Abstract: The treatment of journalists, particularly Western journalists, by groups professing to follow Islamic law has been a frequent media spectacle since 9/11. This article seeks to place this treatment within the context of Islamic law, concluding that the Islamic law of armed conflict prohibits the targeting of journalists in all circumstances. Journalists are entitled to protection under Islamic law due to their status as non-combatants, and/or emissaries, and or Musta’min. It may then be questioned why journalists are targeted by extremist groups claiming strict adherence to Islamic law. Using the so-called Islamic State as a case study, it is argued that the deliberate mischaracterisation of media as an ideological weapon leads to a perceived lawful targeting of journalists as enemy combatants. With the downfall of the Islamic State comes an opportunity to attribute individual criminal responsibility for grave breaches of international humanitarian law, such as the deliberate targeting of journalists. It is proposed that this also presents an opportunity to incorporate Islamic law into the international criminal law process. Thereby increasing the understanding of, and adherence to, a valid interpretation of the Islamic law of armed conflict.

Introduction

The treatment of journalists in armed conflicts is, naturally, a focus of international media attention, particularly where one or more side claims an affiliation with Islam. Despite this, discussion on the status and protection of journalists have not featured heavily in English language commentary on the Islamic law of armed conflict. This paper seeks to address this shortcoming.

Understanding the systematic norms applicable to journalists in armed conflict is of importance to participants in, and audiences of, armed conflict, because their treatment is a particularly visual measurement of any armed group’s conduct. This understanding is of particular importance where the conflict has a religious nexus,
because many of the actors engaged in armed conflicts feel more bound to, and are more inclined to follow, their own religious law and traditions than those under international law.\(^1\) Observing and highlighting the treatment of journalists therefore allows Islamic legal scholars and the Islamic community to observe and evaluate compliance with religious norms, which in turn can help prevent their abuse.

This first part of this paper will therefore focus on the characterisation of journalists in Islam and whether Islamic law offers protection to journalists based on their professional status alone. In the second part of this paper, a case study will try to reconcile such protection with the targeting of journalists by groups who invoke Islam as a justification for their actions.

**International Humanitarian Law**

Muslim jurists developed the Islamic law of armed conflict with the same objectives as International Humanitarian Law (IHL); to alleviate the suffering of, and to protect, the victims of war.\(^2\) It is no surprise, then, that many principles of the Islamic law of armed conflict align with the core principles of IHL.

It is therefore of assistance to examine the position of journalists under IHL. Article 79 of Protocol Additional I to the Geneva Conventions confirms journalists’ status as civilians benefit from the applicable protections. The term “journalist” is not defined under the Geneva Conventions but the ICRC Commentary suggests the definition contained in draft Article 2(a) of the *International Convention for the Protection of Journalists engaged in Dangerous Missions in Areas of Armed Conflict* could serve as a guide for the interpretation of Article 79. According to that definition:\(^3\)

---

\(^1\) Ahmed Al-Dawoody (ICRC), *IHL and Islamic Law in Contemporary Armed Conflicts* (Expert Workshop, Geneva 29-30 October 2018), 22.

\(^2\) Ibid, 19.

\(^3\) Commentary of 1987, *Protocol Additional to the Geneva Conventions of 12 August 1949, and relating to the Protection of Victims of International Armed Conflicts (Additional Protocol I)*, 8 June 1977, Article 79 – Measures of Protection for Journalists, [3264].
The word "journalist" shall mean any correspondent, reporter, photographer, and their technical film, radio and television assistants” who are engaged in the activities which normally form part of the profession in a broad sense: being on the spot, doing interviews, taking notes, taking photographs or films, sound recording etc. and transmitting them to his newspaper or agency.

Journalists are therefore distinct from “war correspondents”, in that they are independent from any side to the conflict. This definition of “journalist” will be maintained in the discussions below for ease of comparative analysis.

However, IHL envisions situations where a journalist would lose the protections afforded to them under the Geneva Conventions. Journalists must not take any actions adversely affecting their status as civilians. Clearly that means refraining from taking direct part in the hostilities, but it is unclear what conduct, beyond picking up a weapon, would relinquish their protection. According to Sassóli, “seeking, transmitting or making public information, even if such information is neither neutral or objective, does not constitute direct participation in hostilities except if it directly allows the enemy to conduct a military operation”. This, for instance, implies that journalists who transmit intelligence to one side in an armed conflict (i.e. spies), for the purposes of military advantage would no longer be entitled to civilian immunity.

---

4 “War correspondent” is used in Article 4(4) of the Third Geneva Convention to refer to journalists embedded with the armed forces of one side to an international armed conflict.
5 Additional Protocol I, Article 79 – Measures of Protection for Journalists.
7 Ibid 257, [8.73].
Journalism in Islam

The role of journalists is understood and expressed differently within particular political and cultural contexts. In many Muslim-majority countries, the media is seen as a potential “agent of change” which has led to a strong tradition of government interventionism coupled with an expectation of adherence to patriotism and particular public morals.

However, the direct relationship between journalism and Islam has received relatively little scholarly attention. Several scholars have based the Islamic understanding of journalism on principles derived from the Qur’an, the Sunnah and Ḥadīth:

1. Truth telling (haqq). The Qur’an instructs: “Do not mix truth with falsehoods” (92:42), which has led to a strong sense of responsibility and accountability on the part of journalists;

2. Spreading truth and good deeds to the public (tabligh). Journalists are expected to play the role of educator who promotes a positive attitude to their audience; this principle is embodied in the Islamic concept of “enjoining what is right and forbidding what is wrong”;

3. Acting in the public interest (maslahah). As the Prophet Muhammad said: “Whoever of you sees an evil action, he must change it with his hand. If he is not able to do so, then with his tongue...” This has been interpreted in this context to mean that journalists are not seen as detached observers, bystanders

---

8 Nurhaya Muchtar et al., ‘Journalism and the Islamic Worldview’ (2017) Journalism Studies, 1, 3.
10 Muchtar et al. (n 9) 4.
11 Ibid 5.
12 Ibid.
13 Excerpt from Ḥadīth 34 as reported by Abu Sa’id Al-Khudri, Ṣahīḥ Muslim 49.
or uninvolved witnesses, to the contrary, they are expected to involve themselves in public discourse;¹⁴ and

(4) Moderation (wasatiyyah), meaning in this context, impartiality and fairness.

There is an obvious tension between the principles of maslahah and wasatiyyah as under the former a journalist is expected to take an interventionist attitude while under the latter a journalist should not endorse one side of the conflict over another.¹⁵ However, as the core meaning behind wasatiyyah is justice, a journalist may be expected to take the “just” side of a particular conflict.¹⁶

It is clear from even a cursory review of the scholarship that, from an Islamic perspective, a journalist’s role needs to be exercised carefully for the sake of developing society, rather than simply reporting ‘news’.¹⁷ There may also be an inherent duty upon Muslim journalists to promote a positive image of Islam. This is perhaps best illustrated by the example of one particularly controversial legal opinion (fatwa) issued against a journalist in Nigeria called for the journalist’s death for insulting the Prophet Mohammed.¹⁸ Nigeria’s Supreme Council for Islamic Affairs considered that the fatwa was illegitimate as the journalist was not a Muslim (implying that it would have been valid if the journalist was a Muslim).¹⁹ The source of this duty may lie in the protection of Islam, required of all believers, including journalists.²⁰

¹⁴ Muchtar et al. (n 9) 5.
¹⁵ Muchtar et al. (n 9) 6; See also Basyouni Hamada, ‘Towards a Global Journalism Ethics Model: an Islamic Perspective’ (2016) 22(2) The Journal of International Communication 1, 18.
¹⁶ Muchtar et al. (n 9) 6.
¹⁷ Ibid 5.
¹⁸ Ibid.
²⁰ Ibid.
The Islamic Law of Armed Conflict

The killing of journalists in armed conflict has been criticised by all manner of Islamic scholars such that it appears without doubt that they are protected by the Islamic law of armed conflict, and yet, it is not clear what the specific source of this protection is. The proceeding paragraphs will analyse several possible characterisations of journalists under Islamic law.

A Noncombatants

Similar to the concept of noncombatant immunity in IHL, Muslim jurists developed a clear distinction between combatants and noncombatants for the purpose of targeting during the conduct of hostilities.\textsuperscript{21} The categories of noncombatants are based on several hadiths attributable to the Prophet which prohibit targeting five specific categories of the enemy population: woman, children, aged and incapacitated persons, clergy and ‘\textit{usafā’}’ (service providers not participating directly in the conduct of hostilities).\textsuperscript{22} The jurists agree that these civilians may forfeit the right to noncombatant immunity if they participate in the fighting or contribute significant support (e.g. planning or financing) to the enemies fighting force.\textsuperscript{23}

It is unclear whether journalists fit neatly into a category of non-combatants under the Islamic law of armed conflict. The Prophet prohibited targeting those (‘\textit{usafā’}’) hired to perform services for the army of the enemy in the battlefield.\textsuperscript{24} Jurists have, through a process of analogical deduction (\textit{qi야s}), extended this to craftsmen who are “confined to their craft”,\textsuperscript{25} which would include journalists operating in a professional manner on the battlefield. This categorisation of journalists as noncombatant ‘\textit{usafā’}

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{21} Ahmed Al-Dawoody, \textit{The Islamic Law of War} (Palgrave Macmillan, 2011) 111.
\item \textsuperscript{22} Ibid.
\item \textsuperscript{23} Ibid 113-115.
\item \textsuperscript{24} Ibid
\item \textsuperscript{25} Translated from “حارف المشغول بحرفته”; See Al-Dawoody 116, referring to Al-Ghazāli, \textit{Al-Wasīṭ}, 7, 20.
\end{itemize}
has been used to conclude that “…kidnapping journalists, and humanitarian workers
[is] totally prohibited in Islam”.26

B  Emissaries

Emissaries, in the Prophet’s time, were people sent from one group to another as
representatives or messengers. The Sunnah states that emissaries are never killed,27
which has been interpreted as them having a “special inviolability”.28 Journalists have
been likened by Islamic scholars to emissaries of truth as their job is to expose the
truth to the public.29 For this reason, their deaths at the hands of the so-called Islamic
State (Da’esh) have been referred to by Islamic scholars as “unquestionably forbidden
(haraam)”.30

C  Musta’min

Journalists could also be considered as musta’min, who’s presence in dar al Islam is
protected under the Qur’anic doctrine of amān. This categorisation is of particular
relevance for more conservative interpretations of shari’a applied by Ibn Ḥazm
(d.456/1064) and Al-Shāfi‘ī (d.204/820) under which a journalist cannot avail himself
of other status-based protections (i.e. the journalist is a non-Muslim male of fighting
age who has not paid the jizyah tax).31

The word mūstamin refers to a person who has been granted quarter or safe conduct
(amān) by the Islamic state. Quarter is a contract of protection granted during the
course of hostilities to former combatants, similar to the IHL status of hors de

26 Al-Dawoody (n 22) 145.
27 Quoting Ibn Masoud in works by Imam Ahmad, Musnad, 6, 306; See Open Letter to Abu Bakr Al-
Baghdadi (19 September 2014) signed by 126 Muslim Scholars, 6 [7].
28 Open Letter to Abu Bakr Al-Baghdadi (19 September 2014) signed by 126 Muslim Scholars, 6 [7].
29 Ibid.
30 Ibid.
31 Al-Dawoody (n 22) 111.
combat. Safe conduct, on the other hand, is a contract for protection granted to any non-Muslim citizen of a country in a state of war with the Islamic state. Unlike quarter, which is initiated by the Muslim side, safe conduct is granted to persons who request it in order to enter into the Islamic state for non-adverse activities such as trade or education. The jurists are unanimous that emissaries are automatically granted safe conduct due to the inherent nature of their work.

D Conclusion on Categorisation

The categories discussed in the preceding paragraphs are not mutually exclusive but can be applied cumulatively. A journalist could enjoy noncombatant immunity and qualify for automatic safe conduct upon entering the Islamic state. It is therefore clear that the Islamic law of armed conflict provides full protection to journalists, in line with that of IHL. Similarly, as under IHL, this protection can be lost through the conduct of the journalist. Such conduct would include taking part in actual fighting or playing a significant role in the planning or financing of military operations. Again, similar to IHL, journalists will forfeit their amān and may lose their noncombatant immunity if they spy against the Islamic state.

Case Study

The relationship between foreign, non-Muslim, journalists and majority Muslim states has not been without tension; in 2012, the Grand Mufti of Saudi Arabia accused foreign media of trying to “spread chaos and strife in Muslim lands.” However, the

---

32 Ibid 130.
33 Ibid.
34 Ibid.
36 Ibid.
37 Ibid 112-114.
38 Ibid 134; Open Letter to Abu Bakr Al-Baghdadi (n 29), 6 [7].
prohibition on targeting journalists under the Islamic law of armed conflict appears to be largely adhered to by Islamic armed groups, with the exception of Da’esh and its predecessor, Al Qaeda in Iraq (AQI). In this respect, the targeting of journalists by Da’esh can be contrasted with the conduct of Al Qaeda Central (AQ). In a 2005 letter from Al Qaeda’s deputy (now leader) Ayman al Zawahiri, to Abu Musab al Zarqawi (AQI’s leader), Zarqawi was told to cease and desist in the public killings of foreign journalists, businessmen and aid workers, since he was losing “Muslim hearts and minds.” Indeed, AQ have been linked to just one known beheading of a journalist; United States citizen Daniel Pearl was killed by Jaish-i-Muhammad, a Kashmiri separatist movement allied to the Taliban and AQ. However, Osama Bin Laden later condemned such conduct for fear it would alienate their supporters.

Explaining Da’esh’s perception and treatment of journalists requires an analysis of their publications, tactics and tawīl (cause). Da’esh practice a particularly radical version of Islam (jihādi-Salafism), which views the world arbitrarily split into two camps: dar al Islam (true believers) and dar al harb (non-believers including Muslims not adhering to the jihādi-Salafism brand of Islam). In 2014, Da’esh instructed their followers to target and kill both civilian and military citizens of “countries that have entered into a coalition against the Islamic State”, however they have shown a particular interest in targeting members of the foreign media. James Foley, Steven Sotloff, Kenji Goto are names of journalists known to have been killed by Da’esh. Austin Tice and John Cantlie are two journalists presumed to still be held by the group in Syria or Iraq.

This author is of the view that Da’esh’s target journalists based on their perception of media as a weapon capable of harming their self-proclaimed ‘state’. The notion of media as an instrument of war is not new or restricted to Islamic armed groups. The Times, Britain’s oldest national daily newspaper, once said, “it is called strategic communications and it is a weapon of war.” AQ’s deputy leader is famous for his statement that, “we are in a battle, and that more than half of this battle is taking place in the battlefield of the media.”

A review of documents produced in Arabic by Da’esh during its administration of Mosul show how the group made a direct linked between foreign media and threat faced by the Islamic State. A statement issued by the Wilāya Nīnawā Media Office in July 2014, laments the harm done to the Islamic State by the “latest falsehood spread around” by the “enemies of Islam”. In another press release, issued by the Islamic State Department of Health, the “Crusader campaign” is characterised as one fought “militarily, politically, [and] in [the] media”.

Insight into Da’esh’s perception of journalists can also be found in the communications between Da’esh and the families of its captives. On 2 December 2013, James Foley’s family received an email from Da’esh confirming that he was being held by the group and that “James was detained while operating as a

44 This view was formed independently during the author’s research but is informed by, and has developed further, the work of Dr Kasun Ubayasiri (Griffith University), ‘Journalism in the Crosshairs: The Islamic State’s Exploitation of Western Media Practice’ (2017) 11 Fusion Journal 1, 4.
46 Ensor, (n 41).
47 Translated to mean “Administration of Nineveh” (Nineveh is a region in Northern Iraq with Mosul as its capital).
journalist”⁵⁰ The family of Peter Kassig, a US aid worker held by Da’esh at the same time as Foley, received a similar email laying out their views in more detail:⁵¹

Peter was acting as a ‘medic’ when captured. We have no doubt that these ‘medics’ are nothing but another front in the battles between the Muslims and the imperial west and its allies…indeed they travel all over the world, mainly to Muslim conflict regions such as Iraq, Syria and Lebanon and other similar countries secretly secularizing and democratizing the poor and displaced Muslim populations.

In Da’esh’s English language magazine, Dabiq it was written in an article concerning Steven Sotloff’s murder, “[t]he war against Islam is a media war as well as a military and intelligence struggle.”⁵² The classification of media as a weapon is then used to justify the killing of foreign enemy journalists not as the murder of impartial observers but as the lawful killing of enemy combatants.⁵³

Such is the perceived threat posed to the Islamic State by foreign media, that Da’esh’s “General Supervisory Committee” prohibited not only all interaction between its population and journalists but also the use of satellite dishes used to watch foreign news television.⁵⁴ However, in exceptional situations, where they believe they can wield the power of foreign media, Da’esh have shown that they are willing to grant amān to journalists from the “enemy” camp. In 2014, German journalist Jurgen Todenhöfer was granted a “contract of safety” to enter the Islamic State by the Office

⁵⁰ United States Department of Justice, (n 44) 11.
⁵¹ Ibid
⁵² The Islamic State, ‘The Failed Crusade’ (2014) 4 Dabiq 1, 47.
⁵³ Kasun Ubayasiri (Griffith University), ‘Journalism in the Crosshairs: The Islamic State’s Exploitation of Western Media Practice’ (2017) 11 Fusion Journal 1, 4.
of the Caliph.\textsuperscript{55} The contract, which refers to both the Islamic legal concepts of \textit{amān} and \textit{must'amin}, requires Da’esh fighters to respect Todenhöfer’s safe passage until he completes his “mission” and “returns to safety”.\textsuperscript{56} The document, attached to this paper, provides primary evidence that Da’esh do not view journalists as neutral or independent from their governments and that, without the granted \textit{amān}, such journalists may be lawfully targeted.

**Conclusion**

Controlling the flow of information from the battlefield can have a huge effect on the outcome of the armed conflict and therefore targeting journalists in armed conflict is, unsurprisingly, not a new phenomenon. Indeed, during the drafting of Additional Protocol I, a proposal for journalists to wear distinct emblems was rejected for fear it making them more visible would endanger them further.\textsuperscript{57} However, this paper has shown that there is nothing within the Islamic law of armed conflict nor the Islamic perception of journalism that could justify the targeting of journalists by armed groups claiming to be acting in accordance with Islam.

The kidnapping and killing of journalists by \textit{jihādi}-Salafist groups such as Da’esh is clearly not in accordance with the Islamic law of armed conflict. The targeting of journalists is but one of the gross violations of Islamic law by Da’esh, such that they have been referred to by Islamic scholars as, “the number one enemy of Islam”.\textsuperscript{58} It is important to note that, at all times, Da’esh have attempted to legally justify their existence and conduct under Islamic law and a focus on IHL alone would thus provide only an external challenge to their illegitimacy, one which they and their supporters

\textsuperscript{55} See Attachment 1.
\textsuperscript{56} See Attachment 1.
\textsuperscript{57} Commentary of 1987, Protocol Additional to the Geneva Conventions of 12 August 1949, and relating to the Protection of Victims of International Armed Conflicts (Additional Protocol I), 8 June 1977, Article 79 – Measures of Protection for Journalists, [3254].
\textsuperscript{58} Mohamed Elewa Badar, ‘Chapter 3: The Self-declared Islamic State (Da’esh) and \textit{Ius ad Bellum} under Islamic International Law’ in The Asian Yearbook of Human Rights and Humanitarian Law (2017) 35, 46.
could ignore. It is therefore essential to analyse and condemn their conduct within the framework of the Islamic law of armed conflict.\(^{59}\)

As the physical infrastructure of the Islamic State crumbles in Iraq and Syria, attention must turn to degrading and illegitimating the ideology behind their meteoric rise to power. It is proposed here that Islamic legal analysis should be incorporated into the transitional justice process as former Da’esh fighters are put on trial in courts around the world.\(^{60}\) Producing modern jurisprudence on the Islamic law of armed conflict by notable Islamic scholars would serve a dual purpose: First, it will provide a legal resource for anyone engaging with Islamic extremist groups, and secondly, it will translate principles of IHL into a normative framework more relevant for millions of people inclined to follow Islamic law, thus increasing the understanding of, and adherence to, a valid interpretation of the Islamic law of armed conflict. As was stated in the introduction to this paper, a correct understanding of Islamic law is key to prevent its abuse in times of armed conflict.

\(^{59}\) A parallel argument is made in relation to *jus ad bellum* by Badar (see above n 59).

\(^{60}\) On October 7 2020, the United States indicted Alexanda Amon Kotey and ElShafee ElSheikh for the murder of four US citizens, including journalists James Foley and Steven Sotloff (see above n 44).
Bibliography

Books:

Ahmad, Imam, *Musnad*, Volume 6


Al-Ghazāli, *Al-Wasīt*, Volume 7

Badar, Mohamed, ‘Chapter 3: The Self-declared Islamic State (Da‘esh) and *Ius ad Bellum* under Islamic International Law’ in *The Asian Yearbook of Human Rights and Humanitarian Law* (2017)


Articles:


Muchtar, Nurhaya, et al., ‘Journalism and the Islamic Worldview’ (2017) *Journalism Studies*


Ubayasiri, Kasun (Griffith University), ‘Journalism in the Crosshairs: The Islamic State’s Exploitation of Western Media Practice’ (2017) 11 *Fusion Journal*

Treaties, Reports and Legislation:


Commentary of 1987, *Protocol Additional to the Geneva Conventions of 12 August 1949, and relating to the Protection of Victims of International Armed Conflicts (Additional Protocol I), 8 June 1977*

Online News Articles:

*Al Arabiya*, ‘Talking to Foreign Media is ‘Haram:’ Saudi Grand Mufti (online, 11 November 2012)  


Haynes, Deborah, ‘Clever PR Glosses Over Vile Message’ The Times (online 19 September 2014) <https://www.thetimes.co.uk/article/clever-pr-glosses-over-vile-message-kmxmvw7t>  


Religious Texts: 

Hadith 34, Abu Sa’id Al-Khudri, Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim 49  

Al-Qur’an (92:42)  

Other:  

Open Letter to Abu Bakr Al-Baghdadi (19 September 2014) signed by 126 Muslim Scholars  

United States Department of Justice, Indictment of Alexandra Amon Kotey and ElShafee ElSheikh, Case No. 1:20-cr-00239-TSE (6 October 2020)  

Islamic State Documents:  


‘The Failed Crusade’ (2014) 4 Dabiq 1, 47  

ATTACHMENT 1*

*Contract of Safe Conduct (amān) for Jurgen Todenhöfer dated 25 Dhu Al-Hijja 1435/19 October 2014.
Towards a Final Combination: Muhammad Iqbal’s Philosophy of History (Part II)

Carimo Mohomed

Dr Carimo Mohomed holds a Ph.D. in Political Theory and Analysis. He also specialised in Library and Information Sciences, and in Islamic Cultures, Civilisations, and Religion. Based in Lisbon, Portugal, his research interests are the History of Political Ideas in the Islamic world and relations between Religion and Politics in different cultural and civilisational contexts, including Political Theology. He serves as Executive Member of the International Political Science Association Research Committee “Religion and Politics” (RC 43); Member of the British Society for Middle Eastern Studies’ “Faith, Politics, and Society” Research Network; and serves on the Editorial Board of the International Journal of Islamic Thought. His Ph.D. thesis was translated into and published in Arabic (https://library.mominoun.com/translattions/5bec480d757a861b5222f170). He has also contributed to The Cambridge Companion to Sayyid Ahmad Khan and to The Oxford Encyclopedia of Philosophy, Science, and Technology in Islam.


Abstract: This paper, using Muhammad Iqbal’s works – especially Secrets and Mysteries, The Message of the East, Persian Psalms and Javid Nama – deals with the question of History and the question of Free Will, Predestination and the Human Being in his thought. According to Iqbal’s interpretation of the Qur’an, History was one of the sources of human knowledge, with one of the most essential teachings of the Qur’an being that nations are collectively judged. In the centre of Iqbal’s vision on Islam was the concept of Tawhid (Oneness), applied not only to God’s own nature but also in its relationship with the world. Because God is an only creator, sustainer and judge of the Universe, God’s will or law also governs all aspects of its creation and should be realised in all areas of life. According to Iqbal, with the advent of Islam, came the age of Creation. Muhammad seemed to stand between the ancient and the modern world: the source of his revelation belonged to the ancient world; the spirit of his revelation belonged to the modern world.

Introduction

Born in Sialkot, 1877, Muhammad Iqbal’s thought developed in an environment in which a critical tradition to the loyalist policies of the All-India Muslim League was growing, and in a Muslim India which would witness the fragmentation of the Ottoman Empire, fragmentation which was seen as a Western threat to Islam. He was a prolific writer, authoring many works covering various fields and genres, including Poetry, Philosophy, and Mysticism, which should be viewed as a unity.¹ According to Masood A. Raja, Iqbal took upon himself the task of deconstructing the benevolent

¹ Anne Marie Schimmel, Islam in the Indian Subcontinent, (Lahore: Sang-e-Meel, 2003), p.229; For detailed information on Iqbal’s life and work see: Hassan, 1998; Taiilieu et al., 2000; Mir, 2006; and Shafique, 2007. Also useful is the site: http://www.allamaiqbal.com/ established by the Iqbal Academy Pakistan.
vision of the West, stressing the darkest aspects of European colonialism and brutality, exposed during the First World War. However, Iqbal’s vision on Europe and the West was not binary.

**Muhammad Iqbal on Free Will and the Predestination of the Human Being**

To understand the perspective of Muhammad Iqbal regarding the question of Free Will, Predestination and the Human Being, one has to analyse his most important works on the subject, namely *Secrets and Mysteries* (1915-22); *The Message of the East* (1923); *Persian Psalms* (1927); and *Javid Nama* (1932).

*Secrets and Mysteries* was the first book of Iqbal’s poetry, written in Persian in the form of *masnavi*. In the prelude, the poet claims that the spirit of the thirteenth century Sufi poet Mawlana Jalaluddin Rumi (1207-1273) asked him in a dream to reveal the secrets that had never been told before. In the first part, “Secrets of the Self” (*Asrar-i-Khudi* in Persian), it is suggested that human beings are driven by ideals. In the second part, “Mysteries of Selflessness”, it is shown that groups are formed because they offer the possibility of having much loftier ideals than an individual may discover otherwise. What connects an individual with others is the “self”, since a human being, an ideal-based society and God can all be perceived as various types of self. Self is strengthened by love, weakened by asking for favours and diminished by the kind of thinking that does not lead to action.

*The Secrets of the Self*, published in 1915, was the first philosophical poetry book by Iqbal, a book which deals mainly with the individual, while his second book *Rumuz-i-Bekhudi* (*The Secrets of Selflessness*, published in Persian in 1918) discusses the interaction between the individual and society. The first of these books is also

---

concerned with the philosophy of religion. In a letter to the poet Ghulam Qadir Girami (d.1927), Iqbal wrote that “the ideas behind the verses had never been expressed before either in the East or in the West.” Reynold A. Nicholson (1868-1945), who translated the Asrar as The Secrets of the Self, says it caught the attention of young Indian Muslims as soon as it was printed. The poems emphasise the spirit and self from a religious, spiritual perspective. In Asrar-e-Khudi, Iqbal explains his philosophy of “Khudi”, or “Self”, and his use of the term “Khudi” is synonymous with the word of “Ruh” as mentioned in the Qur’an, i.e., that divine spark which is present in every human being and was present in Adam for which God ordered all of the angels to prostrate in front of Adam. But one has to make a great journey of transformation to realize that divine spark which Iqbal calls “Khudi”. A similitude of this journey could be understood by the relationship of fragrance and seed. Every seed has the potential for fragrance within it. But to reach its fragrance the seed must go through all the different changes and stages. First breaking out of its shell; then breaking the ground to come into the light developing roots at the same time; then fighting against the elements to develop leaves and flowers; and finally reaching its pinnacle by attaining the fragrance that was hidden within it. To reach one’s “khudi” or “ruh” one needs to go through multiple stages which Iqbal himself went through and encouraged others to travel this spiritual path.

Rumuz-e-Bekhudi was the second philosophical poetry book by Iqbal, and a sequel to The Secrets of the Self. This group of poems has as its main themes the ideal community, Islamic ethical and social principles and the relationship between the individual and society, and Iqbal also recognizes the positive analogous aspects of other religions.

The two collections are often put in the same volume under the title Asrar-o-Rumuz. A.J. Arberry’s English translation of the Rumuz first appeared in 1953.
*Rumuz-i-Bekhudi* is addressed to the world’s Muslims, and Iqbal sees the individual and his community as reflections of each other. The individual needs to be strengthened before he can be integrated into the community, whose development in turn depends on the preservation of the communal ego. It is through contact with others that an ego learns to accept the limitations of its own freedom and the meaning of love. Muslim communities must ensure order in life and must therefore preserve their communal tradition. It is in this context that Iqbal sees the vital role of women, who as mothers are directly responsible for inculcating values in their children.\(^3\)

Like not all seeds reach the level of fragrane, many die along the way incomplete. In the same way, only few people can climb this mount of spirituality, and most get consumed along the way by materialism. The same concept was used by Farid ud Din Attar (1145-1221) in his *The Conference of the Birds*. He proves by various means that the whole universe obeys the will of the “Self”, and Iqbal condemns self-destruction. For him the aim of life is self-realization and self-knowledge. He charts the stages through which the “Self” has to pass before finally arriving at its point of perfection, enabling the knower of the “Self” to become the vicegerent of God.\(^4\)

Immediately after the end of World War I, Iqbal started writing the *Payam-i Mashriq* (*The Message of the East*), which is an answer to the *West-östlicher Diwan* (1819) by Johann Wolfgang von Goethe (1749-1832), and it can be presumed that Iqbal would have thought in this respect to achieve a goal of bringing the East and the West closer to each other. It is evident from some of Iqbal’s ‘Urdu letters that he first disclosed about his book-in-preparation to Syed Sulaiman Nadvi (1884-1953), a distinguished scholar and his esteemed friend, and because of its pre-publication coverage in the literary journals, the *Payam* gained much popularity and the intellectuals as well as

---

\(^3\) The full poem is available in its English translation at [http://www.allamaiqbal.com/works/poetry/persian/ramuz/translation/index.htm](http://www.allamaiqbal.com/works/poetry/persian/ramuz/translation/index.htm)

\(^4\) The full poem is available in its English translation at [http://www.archive.org/stream/secretsofselfasr00iqbauoft#page/n5/mode/2up](http://www.archive.org/stream/secretsofselfasr00iqbauoft#page/n5/mode/2up) and [http://www.allamaiqbal.com/works/poetry/persian/asrar/translation/index.htm](http://www.allamaiqbal.com/works/poetry/persian/asrar/translation/index.htm)
the common readers waited impatiently to see it in printed form. Finally, in May 1923, its first edition came out and was warmly received. The work was presented to the public with the intention of “warming the cold thoughts and ideas of the West”. The work includes a collection of quatrains, followed by a group of poems setting forth Iqbal’s philosophy of life in lyrical form and some poetical sketches that picture European poets, philosophers and politicians. Gothe was among Iqbal’s favourite writers, and *The Message of the East* was written as a response to Goethe’s work.

*The Message of the East* offers an overview of history - past, present and future - from the perspective of Iqbal. It consists of quatrains, short poems, songs, *ghazals* and aphorisms. In the preface we are given two important points to ponder. Firstly, Persian literature had a profound influence on German literature in the late eighteenth century, and Goethe even wrote a “Western Divan” in the manner of Persian poets. The present book is a response to that. Secondly, the civilization of Western colonialism has come to an end with the Great European War (1914-18). A positive spiritual revolution was around the corner, and a new type of human being was in the making, along with a new world for them to live in. However, no world is born in our environment until it has first been conceived in our hearts, which is what the book aims to do.

Published in 1927, *Persian Psalms* includes “The New Garden of Mysteries”, and it is the fourth book of Iqbal’s poetry. It is written as a *masnavi* in Persian, with explicit reference to *The Garden of Mysteries* by the thirteenth century thinker Sheikh Sa’d ad-Din Mahmud Shabistari (1288-1340). Iqbal says about him in the versified preface,

---


“He witnessed before his eyes calamities resulting from the invasion of Genghis Khan. I saw a revolution of another type, the appearance of a new sun.” It may be treated as a summary of Iqbal’s system of thought in the form of nine questions and their succinct answers. *Persian Psalms* aims at helping the emerging nations wash out the effects of slavery so that they may become worthy of independence. The help is offered in four parts, all written in Persian: (a) fifty-six short poems demonstrating several stages in the relationship between the individual and God; (b) seventy-five short poems demonstrating the relationship between the individual and society; (c) a *masnavi*, “The New Garden of Mysteries”, offering an overview of learning in the form of nine critical questions and short answers; and (d) another *masnavi*, “The Book of Slavery,” giving a virtual experience of the difference between the worlds envisioned by slaves and free people in their art forms and religious inspirations. As in other books, Iqbal insists on remembering the past, doing well in the present and preparing for the future. His lesson is that one should be dynamic, full of zest for action and full of love and life.

The *Javid Nama*, the *Book of Eternity* or the *Book of Javid* (Javid was the name of Iqbal’s son), is a book of poetry, published in 1932. It was inspired by Dante’s *Divine Comedy*, and just as Dante’s guide was Virgil, Iqbal is guided by Mawlana Rumi. Both visit different spheres in the heavens coming across different people. Iqbal uses the pseudonym Zinda Rud (a stream full of life) for himself in this book. It was translated into English by Arthur J. Arberry; into German as *Dschavidnma: Das Buch der Ewigkeit* by Annemarie Schimmel; and in Italian as *Il poema Celeste* by Alessandro Bausani. Schimmel also prepared a Turkish translation, *Cevidname*, based on her German edition. In *Javid Nama*, Iqbal follows al-Ma’arri (973-1057), Ibn ‘Arabi (1165-1240), and Dante (1265-1321), guided by Rumi, the master, through various heavens and spheres and has the honour of approaching Divinity and coming in contact with divine illuminations. Several problems of life are discussed, and
answers are provided to them. It is an exceedingly enlivening study. His hand falls heavily on the traitors to their nation like Mir Jafar from Bengal and Mir Sadiq from the Deccan, who were instrumental in the defeat and death of Nawab Siraj-ud-Daula (1733-1757) of Bengal and Tipu Sultan (1750-1799) of Mysore respectively by betraying them for the benefit of the British. Thus, they delivered their country to the shackles of slavery. At the end, by addressing his son Javid, to whom the book is dedicated, he speaks to the young people at large and provides guidance to the “new generation.”

Unlike any other work of Iqbal, this book is a simple narrative: the story of an epic journey in search of immortality. In this journey, the spirit of Rumi takes Iqbal across the spiritual universe. They pass through seven stages – Moon, Mercury, Venus, Mars, Jupiter, Saturn and Paradise. Eventually Iqbal gets to meet God and witness the destiny of humankind. Iqbal faints at the vision, but later shares his insight with the younger generation in the form of some practical advice. In the first chapter, their first stop is the Moon, where they come across seven visions. As they pass the planet Mars, Rumi mentions that the Martians have discovered an inside-out mode of existence: “While our hearts are captivated and controlled by our bodies, the bodies of the Martians are contained in their hearts.”

On Rumi’s suggestion, they take a brief tour of a Martian city, Marghdeen, a city which is a magnificent place with tall buildings. Its people are beautiful, selfless and simple; they speak a language that sounds melodious to the ears. They are not after material goods; rather they are the guardians of knowledge and derive wealth from their sound judgment. The sole purpose of knowledge and skill in that world is to help improve life. Currency is unknown, and temperaments are not to be governed by machines that blacken the sky with their smoke. The farmers are hardworking and

---

contented – there are no landlords to plunder their harvest, and the tillers of the land enjoy the entire fruit of their labour. Learning and wisdom do not flourish on deceit, and hence there is neither army nor need for law keepers, since there is no crime in Marghdeen. The marketplace is free from the noisy shouts and heartrending cries of the beggars. “In this world there is no beggar,” said the Martian Astronomer, “Nor anyone is poor; no slave, no master - no ruler and thus none dominated.” However, Muhammad Iqbal says to the Astronomer: “Being born a beggar or a destitute, to be ruled or suppressed, is all by the decree of God. He alone is the architect of destiny. Destiny cannot be improved by reasoning.”

In The Reconstruction of Religious Thought in Islam, Iqbal considers that the individual, the basic unit of Muslim society, was mandated by the Qur’an (2:30) as God’s vicegerent with the mission of carrying out God’s will on Earth. Muslims shared in this continuous process of creation, bringing order from chaos, to produce a model-society to be emulated by others: the individual was elevated through the community and the community was organized by the individual.

In the centre of Iqbal’s vision on Islam was the concept of Tawhid (Oneness), applied not only to God’s own nature but also in its relationship with the world. Because God is an only creator, sustainer and judge of the Universe, God’s will or law also governs all aspects of its creation and should be realised in all areas of life. For Iqbal, the Qur’an taught us that there may be suffering in the world, but the universe is growing, and the human being can hope for an eventual victory over evil. Wholly overshadowed by the results of his intellectual activity, the modern man had ceased to live soulfully, i.e. from within. In the domain of thought he was living in open conflict with himself; and in the domain of economic and political life he was living in open conflict with others, finding himself unable to control his ruthless egoism and his infinite gold-hunger which was gradually killing all higher striving in him.
However, this belief in the possibility of improvement in the behaviour of man and his control over natural forces was neither optimism nor pessimism, but meliorism, (i.e., it was the recognition of a growing universe and was animated by the hope of man’s eventual victory over evil). And it is with this in mind that we can identify a Philosophy of History in Muhammad Iqbal.

**Muhammad Iqbal’s Philosophy of History**

History, according to Iqbal, is divided into two parts, the Ancient and the Modern World, with the Prophet Muhammad bringing Modernity. How one divides History into periods depends on what one wants, and Iqbal wanted Marghdeen. For him, the Ancient World was characterised by six ages: Inquiry (Pre-History); Discovery (Pre-History to c.1800 BC); Transcendence (c.1800 BC to c.1300 BC); Freedom (c.1300 BC to 559 BC); Action (559 BC to 4 BC); and Expansion (4 BC to 570/610 AD). The ancient world used to have prophets, and was characterised by ready-made judgments, a constant expectation of a redeemer\(^9\), and systems of abstract thought.\(^{10}\)

The prophet Muhammad brought an end to that and thus the modern world was born. This period was characterised by the birth of inductive intellect,\(^{11}\) the abolition of prophethood, priesthood, hereditary kingship,\(^{12}\) and an invitation to humanity for joining on a common ethical ideal. In other words, humanity received Divine input through prophets in the ancient times and now was the time to give output. Muhammad brought about this transition, and with the advent of Islam came the age

---

\(^9\) Iqbal attributes to the ancient world, especially the Magian cultures, “a perpetual attitude of expectation, a constant looking forward to the coming of Zoroaster’s unborn sons, the Messiah, or the Paraclete of the fourth gospel” (Iqbal, 1934, pp. 144-145; see also Iqbal, 1936).


\(^{11}\) “The birth of Islam, as I hope to be able presently to prove to your satisfaction, is the birth of inductive intellect” (Iqbal, 1934, p. 126).

of Creation (610 AD to 750 AD) and the goal is the perpetuation of Unity - solidarity, equality and freedom\(^\text{13}\) - the spread of inductive reasoning, and a gradual movement towards a spiritual democracy.\(^\text{14}\)

Taking a more detailed attention to each of the ages, in the Age of Inquiry, symbolised by Adam, human beings were preoccupied at first with finding the means of survival, which involved the ability to become acquainted with the inner nature of things and the ability to name things. (See: Qur’an, 2: 30-33). As Iqbal, asserted, the point of these verses was that man is endowed with the faculty of naming things, that is to say, forming concepts of them, and forming concepts of them is capturing them.\(^\text{15}\)

Besides naming things, there was Free Choice. For Iqbal, the Qur’anic legend of the Fall had nothing to do with the first appearance of man on this planet. Its purpose was rather to indicate man’s rise from a primitive state of instinctive appetite to the conscious possession of a free self, capable of doubt and disobedience. Man’s first act of disobedience was also his first act of free choice; and that is why, according to the Qur’anic narration, Adam’s first transgression was forgiven. Goodness was not a matter of compulsion; it was the self’s free surrender to the moral ideal and arose out of a willing co-operation of free egos.\(^\text{16}\)

In the second age, that of Discovery, symbolised by Noah, and once survival was ensured, humanity began to appreciate things beyond their utility and to enjoy interacting with them for their own sake, which may have given birth to art and music,
and helped aesthetics by triggering the functions related to the right brain, giving place to the age of Transcendence, symbolised by Abraham, who is considered by Jews, Christians and Muslims to be their founder. His legacy includes the Unity of God, dignity of human being and triumph of reason over superstition. He is remembered as the great patriarch from whom Isaac, Ishmael and their innumerable children were descended. He is also supposed to be the builder of Kaaba, the first sanctuary raised in the name of One God.

With the Age of Moses, ancient rulers derived authority by claiming to be gods or descendants of gods and subjugated the people in the name of these gods. Such kingdoms and empires could not remain legitimate once the belief in false gods had been questioned - internal freedom means external freedom too, and this ideal could be the one presented by Moses, usually considered to be born sometime around 1375 BC. The story of Moses as recalled later in the Bible and in the Qur’an offers symbols and motifs that may also be seen in the legend of Buddha: both heroes are brought up in palaces, leave their royal abodes after some mishap, find the light of God on a tree, return to their people with a message of purification and leave their legacy in the form of commandments. Despite some apparent differences, Buddha and Moses may be seen as two sides of a common ideal: peace within and peace without. In China, a similar role was ascribed to Confucius, the sage who set out in search of an ideal ruler.

In the Age of Action, symbolised by Zulqarnayn, civilization tended to move towards unification of humanity. Once it became impossible to create empires in the names of false gods, Zoroastrian visionaries from Iran found ways of building empires by giving religious freedom. (See: Qur’an, 18:93-98) Zulqarnayn, mentioned in the eighteenth chapter of the Qur’an as a king whom God granted power over earth, has been identified as Cyrus the Great (c. 600-530 BC) who founded the Persian Empire
in 559 BC. A follower of Zarathustra, and perhaps the first great emperor who did not claim to be a god or a descendant of god, his empire was over-run more than two hundred years later by the youthful Greek invader Alexander the Great (356-323 BC), who immediately adopted the ideals and policies of Cyrus, and influenced the Roman conqueror Julius Caesar (100-44BC).

Finally, the last age of the Ancient world was the Age of Jesus, characterised by Expansion. Before the unification dreamed by some visionaries could become a reality, the humanity needed to undergo a phase of wonderment - a stage when it should learn to “give unto Caesar what belongs to Caesar and unto God what belongs to God”. (See: Qur’an, 3: 45-51).

According to Iqbal, with the advent of Islam, came the age of Creation. Muhammad seemed to stand between the ancient and the modern world: the source of his revelation belonged to the ancient world; the spirit of his revelation belonged to the modern world. The birth of Islam was the birth of inductive intellect: prophecy reached its perfection in discovering the need of its own abolition; in order to achieve full self-consciousness, humanity must finally be thrown back on its own resources. Two events from the life of the Prophet Muhammad, which have had the greatest impact on shaping Muslim culture and consciousness, were the Ascension to heaven (miraj) and Migration to Madinah (hijrat). In the words of Iqbal:

A prophet may be defined as a type of mystic consciousness in which ‘unitary experience’ tends to overflow its boundaries, and seeks opportunities of redirecting or refashioning the forces of collective life. In his personality the finite centre of life sinks into his own infinite depths only to spring up
again, with fresh vigour, to destroy the old, and to disclose the new directions of life.\textsuperscript{17}

Conclusion

Our usual conception of time is serial, cinematic rather than dynamic, and our geometrical notion of it tends, as Iqbal says, “to deprive time of its living historical character, and to reduce it to a mere representation of space.” When time is conceived as merely the space separating what is from what will be, we get the picture of “the universe as a collection of finite things, which presents itself as a kind of island situated in a pure vacuity to which time, regarded as a series of mutually exclusive moments, is nothing and does nothing”. Throughout his corpus, he quotes many verses that convey the notion of the continued creation of a world of permanent innovation as opposed to the idea of a finite, achieved act of creation that produced the world \textit{semel factis}, once and for all. For example, to quote other Qur’anic passages: “He [God] adds to His creation what He wills” (\textit{Qur’an}, 35:1), or “Say - go to the earth and see how God hath brought forth all creation: Hereafter will He give it another birth” (29:19). In addition to these citations, he also recalls the prophetic saying: “Do not vilify time, for time is God”.

A few years before the war of 1939-1945, Iqbal wrote:

Both nationalism and atheistic socialism, at least in the present state of human adjustments, must draw upon the psychological forces of hate, suspicion, and resentment which tend to impoverish the soul of man and close up his hidden sources of spiritual energy. Neither the technique of medieval mysticism, nor nationalism, nor atheistic socialism can cure the ills of a despairing humanity. Surely the present moment is one of great crisis in

the history of modern culture. The modern world stands in need of biological renewal. And religion, which in its higher manifestations is neither dogma, nor priesthood, nor ritual, can alone ethically prepare the modern man for the burden of the great responsibility which the advancement of modern science necessarily involves, and restore to him that attitude of faith which makes him capable of winning a personality here and retaining it hereafter. It is only by rising to a fresh vision of his origin and future, his whence and whither, that man will eventually triumph over a society motivated by an inhuman competition, and a civilization which has lost its spiritual unity by its inner conflict of religious and political values.\textsuperscript{18}

Every Philosophy of History tries to answer the question of where to go, and for Iqbal the destination was found in the Qur’an.

Bibliography


Diagne, Souleymane Bachir. ‘Bergson in the Colony. Intuition and Duration in the Thought of Senghor and Iqbal,’ Qui parle, Volume 17, Number 1, (2008), pp. 125-145.


Iqbal, Muhammad. Presidential address delivered at the annual session of the All-India Muslim Conference. Lahore, 21st March, 1932. Available at http://www.koranselskab.dk/profiler/iqbal/address2.htm.


Iqbal, Muhammad. Islam and Ahmadism: with a reply to questions raised by Pandit Jawahar Lal Nehru. (Lahore: Sh. Muhammad Ashraf, 1980) [1936].


Raja, Masood A. ‘Muhammad Iqbal: Islam, the West, and the Quest for a Modern Muslim Identity,’ *The International Journal of the Asian Philosophical Association*, Volume 1, Number 1, (2008), pp. 37-49.


Taillieu, Dieter; Laleman, Francis; and Callewaert, Winand M. *A descriptive bibliography of Allama Muhammad Iqbal (1877-1938).* (Leuven: Uitgeverij Peeters en Departement Oosterse Studies, 2000).

Initial Literary Responses to 9/11: Less About Politics than Religion

Somayyeh Ghaffari and Kim Worthington

Somayyeh Ghaffari is a PhD English Literature Candidate in the School of Humanities, Media and Creative Communication at Massey University. She has been awarded a Massey University full PhD scholarship. Somayyeh is also a Corresponding Associate Research Member with the University of Waikato Islamic Studies Group. She holds a Master’s degree in English Literature from Tabriz Azad University, Iran. Prior to moving to New Zealand, she taught English at universities and private institutes in Urmia, Iran. This article is part of a larger research project that explores the representation of Muslims in English fiction penned by Western authors following 9/11 and compares this with the way Muslims are portrayed by fiction written by (second generation) Muslim immigrants now living in the West. Dr Kim Worthington is a Senior Lecturer in the School of Humanities, Media and Creative Communication at Massey University. She has specialist interests in contemporary global literature and literary ethics and has published widely in this field. In recent years, she has supervised three successful PhDs on Pakistani/Muslim fiction on topics as diverse as: Punjabi (Muslim) folklore; women and nationhood in recent Pakistani fiction; and a comparative assessment of responses to Pakistani fiction in Pakistan, India, the UK and USA. Dr Worthington is an appointed convenor for Massey University doctoral oral examinations, in a wide range of disciplinary areas.

Abstract: For many, 9/11 was initially experienced visually through highly-mediated media images, broadcast repeatedly across television screens all over the world. As the days and weeks passed, people slowly turned to written sources, seeking more detailed information about the events. Some have argued that the accounts provided by fiction writers offered alternatives to the dominant narrative of American heroism and Islamic barbarism and provided more nuanced portrayals of both the victims and the perpetrators. We argue that this is not the case and that most fiction about 9/11 produced by Western authors in the decade after the attacks confirmed key aspects of the dominant narrative. This paper discusses how some well-known fiction writers responded to the attacks in articles and vignettes published in major Western newspapers shortly after the attacks. Overwhelmingly, and perhaps inevitably, there was a strong emphasis on American loss and shock and for many of the authors, 9/11 was less about (global) politics than religion or, more specifically, about Islam.

Introduction

On the morning of 11 September 2001, four coordinated attacks by 19 terrorists associated with the Islamic extremist group Al Qaeda were carried out against targets in the United States. In the most spectacular and deadly of these, two hijacked passenger planes crashed into the twin towers of the World Trade Center in New York City; both collapsed due to the fierce fires that erupted. In total, almost 3000 people were killed and more than 6000 were injured on that day, known as “9/11.” Initially the public experienced these events through highly-mediated images broadcast
repeatedly on television screens. In the ensuing days and months, people slowly turned to written sources for further information: newspapers, personal anecdotes, poetry and, eventually, fiction. This paper discusses how some well-known fiction writers responded to 9/11 in articles and vignettes published in major Western newspapers shortly after the attacks. Overwhelmingly, and perhaps inevitably, there was a strong emphasis on American loss, shock and patriotism. Moreover, for many of the authors, 9/11 became a story about religion or, more specifically, about Islam.

Initial Literary Responses to 9/11

Most people in America (and around the globe) ‘experienced’ 9/11, at least initially, as a series of highly-mediated media images that were broadcasted repeatedly on television screens across the nation and around the world.¹ As Brian A. Monhan argues, “much of how we made sense of the attacks, weeks, and months after their occurrence and, in turn, how we have come to understand and act on ‘9/11’, derives from how the media first constructed and told the tale.”² The way the mainstream media packaged and presented the attacks, he asserts, “tilted the balance in favor of certain interpretations and, by extension, determined the social and political response to the attacks.”³ He continues:

As a result, September 11 became a story primarily about patriotism, loss, and heroes and, for the most part, not a story about US foreign relations, U.S. military policy, poor interagency coordination, government inefficiencies, or other interpretive frames. … ‘9/11’ now represents a well-stocked reservoir of images, symbols, and rhetoric from which political elites, public officials,

¹ According to Douglas Kellner, “[t]he 9/11 terror spectacle unfolded in a city that was one of the most media-saturated in the world and that played out a deadly drama live on television. The images of the planes hitting the World Trade Center towers and their collapse were broadcast repeatedly, as if repetition were necessary to master a highly traumatic event”. Douglas Kellner, “9/11, Spectacles of Terror, and Media Manipulation,” Critical Discourse Studies 1, no. 1 (2004): 43-4.
³ Ibid.
news workers, and other social actors continue to draw in order to invoke certain sentiments of assumptions in their audiences, promote a particular version of reality, and buttress or advance agendas and ideologies.\textsuperscript{4}

Birgit Däwes similarly asserts that “the news networks’ endlessly repeated loops ‘hijacked our imagination’ [quoting Ulrich Baer] and were turned into a visual master narrative, which has dominated the discourse of remembering 9/11 long after the attacks themselves.”\textsuperscript{5}

It has been convincingly argued that television was the primary source of information about the attacks in the days immediately after they occurred.\textsuperscript{6} What happened in Manhattan on that day, insists Thomas Stubblefield, “were images as much or more than actual events.”\textsuperscript{7} But as the days passed, people slowly turned from visual images to other sources as they sought more detailed information about the events, and one of these was newspapers.\textsuperscript{8} Arin Keeble suggests that “perhaps because 9/11 was such a visual spectacle,” in the days and weeks that followed “newspapers and magazines sought literary authors – experts at exploring the human condition through the written word – to interpret or narrate the trauma.”\textsuperscript{9} Several commentators have suggested that it also fell to literature, and so to literary authors, to contest the mainstream or dominant “master narrative” constructed via the media spectacle, a narrative of American victimhood, patriotism, melancholic nostalgia – and moral and cultural

\textsuperscript{4} Ibid., 10-11.
\textsuperscript{5} Birgit Däwes, “”Close Neighbors to the Unimaginable”: Literary Projections of Terrorists' Perspectives (Martin Amis, John Updike, Don Delillo),” Amerikastudien / American Studies 55, no. 3 (2010): 497.
\textsuperscript{7} Thomas Stubblefield, 9/11 and the Visual Culture of Disaster (Indiana University Press, 2015), 3. Katalin Orbán describes 9/11 as a “constitutively visual event that can (and did) become a real time global media spectacle” ibid., qtd. in Stubblefield, 4.
\textsuperscript{8} Monahan, The Shock of the News. Media Coverage and the Making of 9/11, 12.
superiority.10 We disagree with such claims. As we will argue, from the very outset literary responses to September 11, with very few exceptions, worked to further confirm the dominant narrative (and did so for at least the first decade after the attacks). Furthermore, the story told by most literary authors cemented the idea that 9/11 was less about (global) politics than religion or, more specifically, about Islam.

Two major Western newspapers, *The New Yorker* (USA) and *The Guardian* (UK), published responses to the attacks by well-known literary writers and these constitute the first published literary responses to the terror attacks (in English). Considering these enables us to analyse the extent to which these literary responses not only confirmed mainstream media narratives about 9/11 but also fueled Western assumptions linking terrorism with Islam – and thereby emptied the attacks of political content, replacing this with religious stereotyping instead.

Almost two weeks after the attacks, *The New Yorker’s* “Talk of The Town” section, called “Tuesday, and After,”11 included contributions from various New Yorker writers, many of whom are well-known authors of fiction or creative non-fiction. John Updike, Jonathan Franzen, Denis Johnson, Roger Angell, Aharon Appelfeld, Rebecca Mead, Susan Sontag, Amitav Ghosh, and Donald Antrim expressed their disbelief, shock and distress in language that is both raw and figurative, direct and imaginative. Many wrote about the events as a kind of rupture or split between an innocent ‘then’ and traumatized ‘now’: “In the space of two hours, we left behind a happy era of Game Boy economics and trophy houses and entered a world of fear and vengeance” wrote Jonathan Franzen, for example, and Roger Angell said, “The next morning, you

---

10 See, for example, Kathryn Mary Elizabeth Lee, "Fiction as Resistance: The Post-9/11 Novel as an Alternative to the Dominant Narrative” (Masters of Arts in English, Massey University, 2012). Däwes argues that “[i]n the aftermath of 9/11… literature fulfills a wide range of functions … and creates a site for the simultaneous articulation of multiple, even conflicting perspectives – including those of (imaginary) terrorists” Däwes, “Close Neighbors to the Unimaginable”: Literary Projections of Terrorists’ Perspectives (Martin Amis, John Updike, Don Delillo),” 499.

awoke both bereft and older... This week has been different but the same: how innocent we were back then in the sixties and back last Monday.”

Very common, too, was the idea that the horror of the events were “unthinkable” or “unimaginable” and impossible to articulate directly. The art and craft of creativity was needed to “say” what normal thought, everyday language or realistic photographs could not.12 “But what can one say when what is happening blunts the few thoughts that one has?” wrote Aharon Appelfeld, for example. Most of the essays are elegiac in tone, and decidedly insular. Not much is said about the terrorists, but what is said is telling. John Updike, one of America’s best-known writers of fiction describes himself watching as the south tower and recalls seeing “the footage of hellbent airplane, exploding jet fuel, and imploding tower” which was “played and replayed, [like] much rehearsed moments from a nightmare ballet.” He characterises the terrorists as “[d]etermined men who have transposed their own lives to a martyr’s afterlife.” While this doesn’t directly name the terrorists as Muslim, the mention of “a martyr’s afterlife” points towards this. In the piece that follows, Jonathan Franzen is more overt in evoking the religion of the terrorists: “Never mind whether certain Palestinians were or were not dancing in the streets,” or “some of these glad artists were hiding in ruined Afghanistan” he writes. He continues,

I’m trying to imagine what I don’t want to imagine: the scene inside a plane one moment before impact. At the controls, a terrorist is raising a prayer of thanks to Allah in expectation of instant transport from this world to the next one, where houris will presently reward him for his glorious success.

12 Artist Ejay Weiss captures this in his diary entry for the day, suggesting that visual art may be able to “render” and convey what words are unable to: “The unthinkable and unimaginable has occurred. /A horror of devastation and death — /A void /A violence beyond grasp.” In Ejay Weiss, “Rendering the Unthinkable: Artists Respond to 9/11,” http://rendering.911memorial.org/artists/ejay-weiss/.
Denis Johnson, in his contribution, rationalises the events by evoking America’s ‘enemies’: “I think we sense … the reality that some people hate America.” While he appears to acknowledge the American hubris and actions that may have generated such hatred, he does so by evoking what “some people” might think of the USA and how “those people” have acted in consequence. His, then, is a version of what was quickly becoming the official rhetoric about the attacks, one in which “us” and “them” are opposed in binary moral terms:13 “The acts of terror against this country … tell us how much they hate us. They hate us as people hate a bad God, and they’ll kill themselves to hurt us.”14

Many of the contributors to the “Tuesday, and After” feature echoed similar sentiments – but not all. Susan Sontag’s untitled, 460-word essay was controversial – and to some outrageously unpatriotic (as was Noam Chomsky’s various essays and interviews, collected under the title 9-11, and published a few months later). 9/11 caused a surge of national pride in the U.S.A., resulting in “immediate, visibly evident increases in expressions of national identification and unity throughout the United States.”15 The words of Sontag and Chomsky flew in the face of popular opinion, resulting in them being labelled “anti-American.”16

Despite the fact that Sontag had supported Salman Rushdie in the early days of the Ayatollah Khomeini’s death sentence against him, making her a potential target of Islamic extremists,17 she was deeply critical of American foreign policy and what she referred to in her essay as the Bush Government’s and patriotic media’s “self-

---

13 This is succinctly captured in US President Bush’s repeated phrase: “Either you are with us, or you are with the terrorists.”
14 “Tuesday, and After.”
righteous drivel and outright deceptions.” She decried “the sanctimonious, reality-concealing rhetoric” that was quickly becoming the dominant (Western political and media) narrative about the attacks:

Where is the acknowledgment that this was not a ‘cowardly’ attack on ‘civilization’ or ‘liberty’ or ‘humanity’ or ‘the free world’ but an attack on the world’s self-proclaimed superpower, undertaken a consequence of specific American alliances and actions? How many citizens are aware of the ongoing American bombing of Iraq? And if the word ‘cowardly’ is to be used, it might be more aptly applied to those who kill from beyond the range of retaliation, high in the sky, than to those willing to die themselves in order to kill others. In the matter of courage (a morally neutral virtue): whatever may be said of the perpetrators of Tuesday’s slaughter, they were not cowards.18

Sontag was, as Patricia Keeton suggests, something of a lone voice at the time, writing against the mainstream media’s characterisation of America “as a victim rather than an aggressor.” As Keeton notes, “[h]er piece was vilified in the media.”19 It caused outrage and she was widely attacked for her opinion. Madeleine Elfenbein notes that Sontag was: “among a tiny minority of public figures [taking this stance], who would shrink to virtually nil when they saw what happened to her. She was called ‘deranged,’ ‘an ally of evil,’ and ‘a despicable woman’; former New York City Mayor Ed Koch declared she belonged in the ninth circle of hell.20 According to Daniel Lazare, “a columnist for the New York Post, expressed a desire “to walk barefoot on broken glass across the Brooklyn Bridge, up to that despicable woman’s

---

18 “Tuesday, and After.”
apartment, grab her by the neck, drag her down to ground zero and force her to say that to the firefighters.”

As these comments suggest, many believed that Sontag’s essay was ill-timed, insensitive and lacked respect for public emotions and grief, which could be the reason why, in an interview with David Talbot in the Salon, she attempted to defend her New Yorker essay. In the interview she stated that she was surprised by the hostile reaction to it: “I did not think for a moment my essay was radical or even particularly dissenting. It seemed very common sense.” When asked about her position on “the war against terrorism” she replied that as a secular person and as a woman she was “appalled by the Taliban regime” but she did not think that bombing was the answer. Sontag stated her belief that “there’s a great disconnect between reality and what people in government and the media are saying of the reality” and that “what is being peddled to the public is a fairy tale. And the atmosphere of intimidation is quite extraordinary.”

Interestingly, and importantly, the charges laid against Sontag by so many were framed not in the political and ethical terms she used, but in very specific religious ones. Consider this, for example, from “Open Letter to Susan Sontag,” penned by Melissa Byles:

[I]s not ‘cowards’ an apt word for fanatics of all sorts? Obviating life’s perplexing ambiguities, the difficult problems of being in the world and of living with others, in the name of a simple faith in a beyond – in this particular case, a faith which promises those young men who blow themselves up for Allah eternal delights in a paradise where flow rivers of milk, wine and

clarified honey, with beautiful maidens whose virginity is ever renewed, like the moon – may we not properly call such contempt for life and such simple faith cowardly?23

Whether or not the suicidal terrorists should or should not rightly be called “cowards” is beside the point. What is crucial here is the resort to a crude caricature of Islamic belief, much like that used by Jonathan Franzen (quoted above), as a means of describing the terrorists’ motivations and a complete refusal to engage with the thrust of Sontag’s argument – her critique of American global imperialism.

In his collection of essays/interviews published in November 2001, simply titled 9/11, Noam Chomsky adopts a similar stance to Sontag and sets the attacks in a wider context of American global (military) intervention. He writes about the CIA’s involvement in arming and training of Afghanistan’s mujahideen during the 1980s. He also points to the U.S. government’s hypocrisy in defining the word terrorism as “the use of violence for political or psychological goals rather than monetary gain – in light of the fact that U.S. government agencies have been using exactly those methods for decades, directly and indirectly.”24 As with Sontag’s short essay, Chomsky’s was immediately reviled by many in the West as anti-American. Stefan Kanfer, for example, in a tellingly-titled review, “America’s Dumbest Intellectual,” wrote:

> On the rare occasions in 9/11 when Chomsky expresses condolences for the victims of the terrorist attack, he immediately goes on to excoriate the U.S. ...
>
> The West is the Great Satan, the Third World its eternal victim. The World

---

Trade Towers were a symbol of America’s gluttony and power. In effect, we were asking for it and are now unjustly using it as a *casus belli*.\(^{25}\)

As with angry responses to Sontag’s comments, many of Chomsky’s detractors ignore his arguments about global politics in favour of blunt assertions about religion. Anab Whitehouse offers a glaring example of the ways in which critics of Chomsky routinely exchange the words “attackers” or “terrorists” with the word “Muslims”: “Professor Chomsky’s … words [in 9/11] often seem to be remarks of equanimity and detachment in which, apparently, among other things, it doesn’t matter whether *Muslims* did, or did not, attack the United States on 9/11” (our emphasis).\(^{26}\)

Examples of such reactionary responses to these early challenges to the dominant narrative about 9/11 can be and have been multiplied. Suffice to say, as Simon Schama did in *The Guardian*, “the shroud of mass reverence which enveloped everyone and everything after 9/11 […] has succeeded in making secular debate about liberty into an act of indecency, disrespectful of the dead and disloyal to the flag.”\(^{27}\)

The issue at stake, of course, is that 9/11—at least for many (westerners) in the decade after—could not be thought about in “secular” terms. It was, they believed, fundamentally about religion, in terms that pitted ‘the free world’ against Islam.

Kathryn Lee, drawing on Frederic Jameson’s well-known essay “The Dialectics of Disaster” (2002) suggests precisely this: the post-9/11 American/Western “performance of trauma required there to be an ‘other’ which was clearly marked: the face of Muslim men with beards became synonymous with the concept of terrorist.”\(^ {28}\)

According to Uzma Jamil, as a result of 9/11:


The subject positions available to Muslims in [western] hegemonic discourse are linked to the way in which terrorism is defined as an ‘Islamic’ problem because Muslims carried out the 9/11 attacks. Terrorism is explained as a religious problem, rather than as a political issue, by linking it to the religion of the attackers. By association then, all Muslims have this ‘inherent’ tendency to be potential terrorists because they are Muslims. Their actions can be explained solely and exclusively through reference to their religion, which is also perceived as ‘inherently’ violent. Quranic verses are often presented as literal evidence of this Muslim propensity for ‘Islamic’ terrorism.  

While Sontag resisted this narrative in the immediate aftermath of 9/11, and Chomsky did the same in a couple of months later, it is clear that the overwhelming initial response of American writers to the terrorist attacks was in line with that of the majority of the patriotic public: “Muslims – all Muslims everywhere – must take moral responsibility for the 9/11 attacks because they are all Muslim.”

The day after 9/11, the British newspaper The Guardian’s literary commentator was Ian McEwan, who would later pen his own 9/11 novel, Saturday (2005). In “Beyond Belief” published on 12 September, he started by saying that the reality of what had occurred and the world had witnessed was unimaginable. The events had become “a spectacle,” he acknowledged, transmitted far and wide to a global audience. He spoke of his hunger, and that of others, for more news immediately following the attacks, and wrote of his shock, “[t]here was barely time to contemplate the cruelty of the human hearts that could unleash this.” He concluded the essay by saying “Our civilisation, it suddenly seemed, our way of life, is easy to wreck when there are sufficient resources and cruel intent. No missile defense system can protect us.”

30 Ibid.
use of the collective pronoun, “our” is notable, along with the noun it qualifies, and
asserts is unprotected: “civilisation”, Western civilization, of course.31

McEwan published a second piece for The Guardian, a few days later (15 September),
with a by-line that read, “Only love and then oblivion.” He began by describing (as
many would do in the weeks and months after) the emotional responses of an
unidentified plural group (signaled by “we” or “us”) who are “together” in “our”
grief: “the sense that we are doing it more or less together is one tiny scrap of
consolation. The other “consolidations” he writes of are love and (empathetic)
imagination. “Love,” he asserts is what we, like the victims, can hold onto in the face
of “some holy fool, who believes in his place in eternity.” Of the latter he suggests
that “empathy [is the ability] to think oneself into the minds of others,” and insists that
this is precisely what the 9/11 terrorists were unable to do: “The hijackers used
fanatical certainty, misplaced religious faith, and dehumanising hatred to purge
themselves of the human instinct for empathy. Among their crimes was a failure of
the imagination.” The capacity to imagine – that which surely characterises writers of
fiction – is raised to the status of a moral virtue by McEwan:

If the hijackers had been able to imagine themselves into the thoughts and
feelings of the passengers, they would have been unable to proceed. It is hard
to be cruel once you permit yourself to enter the mind of your victim.

Imagining what it is like to be someone other than yourself is at the core of our
humanity. It is the essence of compassion, and it is the beginning of
morality.32

McEwan reiterated these ideas in an interview with Helen Whitney a few months
later, in April 2002: “As I said at the time, what those holy fools clearly lacked, or

32 “Only Love and Then Oblivion. Love Was All They Had to Set against Their Murderers,” ibid. 15
clearly were able to deny themselves, was the ability to enter into the minds of the people they were being so cruel to.” Further:

You cannot be cruel to someone if you fully understand what it is to be them. You have to somehow screen that out. You have to say to yourself, ‘They’re not really humans.’ Or you have to bring into line some sort of powerful ideology or some crazed religious certainty in order to blot out that human instinct.33

Ironically, despite McEwan suggesting that the terrorists behaved as they did because they told themselves their victims were “not really humans,” McEwan tells himself precisely this about the terrorists. If “[i]magining what it is like to be someone other than yourself is at the core of our humanity” then the incapacity to do this, the failure of which he accuses the terrorists, means they are not only immoral, but inhuman.

Martin Amis was another British novelist who wrote for The Guardian in the days after 9/11. His piece, called “Fear and Loathing,” was published on 18 September 2001. Partway into the article, Amis writes, “The message of September 11 ran as follows: America, it is time you learned how implacably you are hated.” Amis’s take on the morality of the terrorists’ echoes that of McEwan:

The bringers of Tuesday's terror were morally ‘barbaric’, inexpiably so, but they brought a demented sophistication to their work. … The firefighters were not afraid to die for an idea. But the suicide killers belong in a different psychic category, and their battle effectiveness has, on our side, no equivalent.

33 In the interview McEwan admits to not believing in evil or God, rather in people behaving well and “sometimes behaving monstrously” and because this behavior is so beyond our capabilities to comprehend and explain that we “have to reach for this numinous notion of evil”. When asked about his views on religion, he answered that he does not believe that there is “any inherent darkness at the center of religion at all” and “rather he views religion as a “morally neutral force” which some “people rise up and perform terrible things in its name, just as people perform extraordinarily fine, courageous things in its name.” Helen Whitney, "Faith and Doubt at Ground Zero," Frontline April 2002, n.p.
Clearly, they have contempt for life. Equally clearly, they have contempt for death.\textsuperscript{34}

Yet Amis also notes that it “will be horribly difficult and painful for Americans to absorb the fact that they are hated, and hated intelligibly.” He provides a sobering figure to account for this: “How many [Americans] know … that their government has destroyed at least 5% of the Iraqi population? How many of them then transfer that figure to America (and come up with 14m)?” In the lines that follow he points the finger at Americans for their lack of precisely that which McEwan suggests is at the core of humanity, the capacity for empathy: “Various national characteristics – self-reliance, a fiercer patriotism than any in western Europe, an assiduous geographical incuriosity – have created a deficit of empathy for the sufferings of people far away.” He also draws attention to something “almost tautologous,” the idea that “Americans [believe they are] are good and right by virtue of being Americans.”\textsuperscript{35} Amis notes that a violent counter strike by America is inevitable (and he was correct). He asserts his hope that “the response will be, above all, non-escalatory” (his hopes were futile).\textsuperscript{36}

Despite the sentiments expressed here, within a few years, Amis appears to have reverted to the kind of divisive, binary logic he had argued against in his first essay on the attacks. In an interview with Ginny Dougary, transcribed and published in The Times Online, 15 September 2006, he said:

The Muslim community will have to suffer until it gets its house in order. What sort of suffering? Not let them travel. Deportation – further down the road. Curtailing of freedoms. Strip-searching people who look like they’re from the Middle East or from Pakistan…. Discriminatory stuff, until it hurts the whole community and they start getting tough with their children. They

\textsuperscript{35} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{36} Ibid.
hate us for letting our children have sex and take drugs—well, they’ve got to stop their children killing people. … It’s their own past they’re pissed off about; their great decline. 37

Much has been written about Amis’s discriminatory anti-Muslim sentiments expressed here and also the very public spat these words initiated with his (then) fellow academic colleague Terry Eagleton who accused him of racism in 2007, drawing attention to this and other comments by Amis. The left-leaning Guardian ran a bold feature titled “Martin Amis and the New Racism,” and Amis responded defensively, insisting that his words had been reproduced out of context by Dougary. 38 Journalist Yasmin Alibhai-Brown wrote a strong condemnation of him in the Independent, 17 September 2007, including the following lines:

I see [Amis] as another kind of threat to the kind of society I stand up for. He is with the beasts pounding the back door, the Muslim-baiters and haters, these days as likely to come from the Groucho and Garrick clubs as the nasty, secret venues used by neo-fascists. … Last month, Amis bared his expensive teeth and has just been denounced by the Marxist academic Terry Eagleton. Amis wants to strip-search anyone who looks Muslim (me too, then, Martin? Shall I lift my skirt the next time we meet to reassure you?). 39

Amis responded with an open letter to Alibhai-Brown which, if intended to put out the flames, only stoked them further with antagonistic comments like these: “You see, time ha[s] advanced, in the West, since [Rushdie published The Satanic Verses in] 

38 He claimed the passage she quoted (“The Muslim community will have to suffer…”) was, in the interview, prefaced by the words, “There’s a definite urge – don’t you have it? – to say, ‘The Muslim community … (etc.).’” Quotes in Jonathan Brown, “Amis Launches Scathing Response to Accusations of Islamophobia,” Independent 11 October 2011; Yasmin Alibhai-Brown, “Yasmin Alibhai-Brown: It’s Time for Civilised and Honest Engagement,” ibid. 17 September 2011, n.p.
39 “Yasmin Alibhai-Brown: It’s Time for Civilised and Honest Engagement.” Amis also rebutted Eagleton’s claims that he was a racist in a live interview with Jon Snow on Channel 4 News in which he insisted his words were intended as an attack on Islamism, “an extreme ideology within a religion,” not Islam in general.
1989. Time moves more slowly in Iran and Pakistan. As I don’t need to tell you, Yasmin, there is something the matter with the Islamic clock”; and “[a]dherence, however ‘moderate’, to a holy book that recommends (for instance) the murder of apostates and the beating of women (on suspicion of disobedience) carries certain consequences.”

For all this, some critics have praised Amis for being one of only a few Western writers who have, in the words of Däwes: “attempted imaginative constructions of the terrorists’ perspectives” in their post 9/11 fiction. The Amis text Däwes has in mind, and discusses at length in an article published in 2010, is his short story, “The Last Days of Muhammad Atta” (2006). This appeared in The New Yorker on 17 April 2006 and was collected in his book The Second Plane (2008), which includes twelve essays and reviews and two short stories. In The “Author’s Note” to the collection, Amis writes:

> Geopolitics may not be my natural subject, but masculinity is. And have we ever seen the male idea in such outrageous garb as the robes, combat fatigues, suits and ties, tracksuits, and medics’ smocks of the Islamic radical? I was once asked ‘Are you an Islamaphobe?’ And the answer is no. What I am is an Islamismophobe, or better say an anti-Islamist, because a phobia is an irrational fear, and it is not irrational to fear something that says it wants to kill you.

It is not possible, in this short essay, to undertake a necessarily careful and extensive discussion about whether Martin Amis is or is not just anti-Islamist but is also anti-Islam. Doing so would require careful analysis of his many writings, fictional and

---

40 The letter is reproduced in full in Jonathan Brown, ibid.

41 Däwes, “‘Close Neighbors to the Unimaginable’: Literary Projections of Terrorists' Perspectives (Martin Amis, John Updike, Don Delillo),” 496. In this article she also discusses John Updike’s Terrorist (2006) and Don DeLillo’s Falling Man (2007) as novels that adopt a “terrorist’s point of view.”

nonfictional. Suffice to say that “The Last Days,” which is written from the perspective of one of the 9/11 terrorists, is replete with stereotypical portrayals of Muslim belief (although the protagonist is an atheist) and not-too-subtle choices of diction and imagery that seem to have been deliberately chosen to offend Muslim readers. What it is possible to assert, however, is that even in their earliest responses to 9/11, prominent Western literary authors, with few exceptions, functioned to reiterate and circulate an account of events that was less about politics than about religion.

43 The protagonist’s constipation, for example, is described as “something very close to the sensation of anal rape” (162).
Bibliography


Däwes, Birgit. ""Close Neighbors to the Unimaginable": Literary Projections of Terrorists' Perspectives (Martin Amis, John Updike, Don DeLillo)." Amerikastudien / American Studies 55, no. 3 (2010): 495-517.


The Contributions of Shaykh Aliyu Harazimi to the Production of Islamic Manuscripts

Auwalu Muhammad Hassan

Auwalu Muhammad Hassan is a Lecturer in the Department of History at Sa’adatu Rimi College of Education Kumbotso, Kano, Nigeria. He holds a BA and a MA in History and a MA from Bayero University, Kano. His research fields include, history of Islam, Sufism, manuscript studies, Muslim Ulama, Islamic scholarship, and religious groups.

Abstract: This paper examines the contributions of Shaykh Aliyu Harazimi to the production of Islamic manuscripts production. The existing literature pays more attention to the authorship of other figures among the ulama, while neglecting the efforts of Shaykh Aliyu Harazimi in the production of manuscripts. In fact, very few, even among the Sufi circle are aware of his authorship simply because he is considered more of a Sufi who dedicated his life to the training of muridun (disciples) than a writer and author. It is against this background that the paper examines the manuscripts written by the Shaykh through gathering them and exploring their contents. The paper also documents and analyses his works on variety of subjects such as guidance to spiritual perfection of the seeker, devotional practices as well as prayers. Most of the sources used in this paper are rare primary documents that are available to the researcher and were not analyzed by any scholar. The paper argues that, in addition to being a renowned Gnostic of high repute in northern Nigeria, Shaykh Aliyu Harazimi was as well a prolific writer whose works are only available to his close associates.

Introduction

Sufi literature began in the 9th century and consists of prose, poetry, and devotional writings. The early Sufi teachings of esoteric knowledge were based on the transmission of instructions and guidance by word of mouth. Some of the early Sufi works are: Kitab al-ri’ayah, (Book of Consideration) authored by Abu Abdallah al-Harith bn Asad al-Muhasibi (d. 857), Hikayat al-Mashayakh of Abu Muhammad Ja’afar bn Muhammad al-Khuldi (d.348/959), Kitab at– Ta’arruf (Book of Introduction) written by Abubakar Muhammad al-Kalabadhi (d. 990-995), Kitab al-Luma (Book of Concise Remarks) authored by Abu Nasr Abdallah bn Ali as-Sarraj of Tus (d. 378/ 988), Tabaqat al-Sufiya of Abu Abdulrahman Muhammad bn al Hussain al Salami (d.412/1021), Hilayat al-Auliya of Abu Nu’aim Ahmad bn Abdallah al-Esfahani (d.430/1038), Al-Risala of Abu al-Qassim al- Qushary (d.465/1072) and
*Kashf al-Mahjub* of Abul Hassan al-Hujwiri (d.467/1075)\(^1\). The Qur’an is a comprehensive primary text that motivated and inspired the minds of *Sufi* scholars of all generations to contribute to the production of confessional literature.\(^2\)

*Sufi* teachings place great emphasis on the purification of heart (*qalb*). According to Rumi, the heart of the *Sufis* “…is higher than the heavens, because it has become cleansed of the impurities which taint it. A purified heart is no longer of this world since it has transcended the ephemeral, phenomenal order. It now has a direct relationship with the unseen.”\(^3\) As a result of repeated references to the heart in both the Qur’an and *Ahadith* of the Prophet, the *Sufi* scholar and theologian Abu Hamid Muhammad al-Ghazzali (d.505/1111) devoted a great deal of his writings to the nature and function of the heart. Ahmad Sam’ani (d. 534/1140) the twelfth century *Sufi* master comments on the heart’s reality as follows:

> From the spirit the heart took subtlety and from the earth gravity. It came to be praised by both sides and was well pleasing to both. It became the locus for the vision of the unseen. The heart is neither spirit nor bodily frame. It is both spirit and bodily frame. If it is spirit, where does this embodiment come from? And if it is bodily frame, why does it have subtlety? It is neither that nor this. But it is both that and this.\(^4\)

The Tijaniyya scholars both connected to the *Faydah*\(^5\) (divine flood) networks and non-*Faydah* networks have been amongst the most prolific authors in the production of manuscripts in the Northern and Western regions of the African continent in the

---


\(^2\) Abdur-Razzaq Mustapha Balagun Solagberu, “A Presentation of Extracts”, p.74.


\(^4\) Mohammed Rustom, “Rumi’s Metaphysics”, p.70.

last two centuries. The Tijjaniyya scholars and their disciples were and are still people deeply rooted in Sunnah, traditional ideas concerning the combination of piety, knowledge as well as Islamic religious practices. The numerous followers of Shaykh Ibrahim Inyass (d. 1975) came from the sector of learned scholars who contributed to a significant revival of the production of manuscripts similar to that which was experienced under the 19th century Jihad leader in Hausaland, Shaykh Usman Danfodio (d. 1817).

In Kano, for example, Shaykh Abubakar Atiq (d.1974), Ahmad Tijjani Usman (d.1970) and Muhammad Sani Hassan Kafinga (d. 1989), and host of others had authored a considerable number of works. The themes of the Tijjaniyya manuscripts produced by the Tijjaniyya Faydah network of Nigeria reveal that the authors were not simply promoting Tijjaniyya views but also those of learned scholars that contributed to various aspects of Islamic worship and study. The works of Shaykh Aliyu Harazimi are highly esoteric in nature and are similar to the traditional Islamic scholarship tradition of Northern Nigeria. Prophetic devotional manuscripts dominated his works as most of them are on sending prayers and blessings on the Prophet.

10 For some of the Tijjaniyya scholars writings and non-Tijjaniyya, see: John O. Hunwick, Arabic Literature of Africa: The Writings of Central Sudanic Africa, Voume.2, (Leiden: Brill, 1995).
The Writings of Shaykh Aliyu Harazimi

Shaykh Aliyu Harazimi was born in 1919 in Hausawa quarters inside the ancient city of Kano and died in 2013. He was an Islamic scholar, religious leader, Tijjaniyya Shaykh, author of a number of manuscripts as well as respected elder in Kano. All his life was dedicated to Islam, teaching, spiritual training, moral inculcation, good conduct, admonishing, advising and helping weak and hopeless people. His house and Zawiyah was a centre for spiritual and educational training. He totally devoted his life to upholding the teachings of the Prophet. He had large followings in Kano and beyond. He represented the epitome of piety. His zawiyah in Kano was, and remains, prominent for its outstanding practicing of pristine Islam and Sufism.12

Islamic manuscripts can be defined as any handwritten or unpublished works which deal with Islam, and any related topic such as legal response, poems, eulogy, prose, legal texts, correspondences, commentaries, prayers and panegyric poetry on the Prophet Muhammad.13 The Sufi manuscripts with mystic themes, include themes as diverse as: Divine love (al-Hubb al – Ilahi), the love of the Prophet Muhammad and his family, offering prayers and blessings to the Prophet (Salat alal Naby), panegyrics on the Prophet (al – Mada’ih an – Nabawiyya), the principles of The Reality Essence of Prophet Muhammad (al – Haqiqatul Muhammad), Existential Unity (Wahdatul – Wujud), Experiential Unity, (Wahdatil ash – Shuhud) Litanies and Supplicatory Prayers (Al-Adhkar wa ad-Daa’at) and Fervent Plea or Seeking Request for Intercession and Assistance (At –Tawassul wal-Istighatha).14

---

The goal or aim of Sufi writings is to serve as a literary spiritual guidance for disciple(s). It can also articulate the relationship between the Shaykh (spiritual master) and murid (disciple) in providing the necessary guidance for the spiritual journey and its progress. The Sufi writings also provide Islamic legal proof for Sufism.15

**Themes of His Works**

*Shaykh* Aliyu Harazimi was one of the Islamic and Tijjaniyya scholars who wrote many Islamic manuscripts. Some of his writings are still in manuscripts form while others have been lithographed.16 He authored many works that were not stored in a systemic manner, hence their total number is not known.17 It is believed that many of his books may be ‘lost’. It was very common when a book was lent to another person, he might refuse to bring it back to the owner. This makes it difficult to determine such manuscripts. Borrowers forget or intentionally pretend to forget and materials on loan may subsequently transform into a part of their own collection of personal material.18

The available manuscripts of *Shaykh* Aliyu Harazimi are of two categories. The first category concerns Sufi manuals. The second is on the offering and sending *Salat alal Naby* (prayers and blessings to the Prophet Muhammad), and also gratitude and the praise of Allah.

The themes of the writings of *Shaykh* Aliyu Harazimi emphasize the provision of religious guidance, identifying obstacles, challenges and difficulties that a seeker of spiritual perfection might encounter during his spiritual journey. The works also

---

16 Interview with Ahmad Tijjani (Kawu) the son of *Shaykh* Aliyu Harazimi, who now runs the affairs of the Zawiya on 5/10/2012.
17 Interviews with a deputy, disciple and confidant of *Shaykh* Aliyu Harazimi Sayyadi Mustapha Aliyu Diso on 4/11/2012, Diso Quarters, Kano city and Khalifa Ahmad Tijjani Aliyu Harazimi (Kawu) Hausawa quarters Kano city.
outline the clear path that a seeker of spiritual perfection can pursue to achieve his goal. The works also provide a guideline on how a seeker of spiritual perfection can become true servant of Allah alone, follower of Prophet Muhammad and a good Muslim. The other works are on Salat alal Naby. Such literature is a testimony to the immense love, eulogizing and longing for the Prophet Muhammad, fana (annihilation) and gratitude as well as praising of Allah, articulated by Shaykh Aliyu Harazimi.

In these works, he praises Allah and testifies his gratitude to Him. Shaykh Aliyu Harazimi has come out clearly as true Tijjaniyya scholar. He has prayed to his children, parents, mentors, wives, relatives, disciples, students, lovers, followers and Khadims (assistants) in several places in the works. He has also prayed for shafa’a (intercession) for his followers to be mahfuz (kept safe) and to be true Muslims, followers of Qur’an and Prophet Muhammad as well as true Tijjaniyya members. He also prayed against the enemies of Islam, his enemies’ nafs (ego soul), qalb (heart), envy, jealousy, devil, demons, evils, arrogance, backbiting, lies, the love of luxury, and any danger. He also asked Allah for forgiveness, lutf (divine grace), mercy, trust and bounties on him, his children, relatives, disciples, students, followers, lovers, and Muslims in general. He also prayed for success during the crossing of the narrow bridge in the Hereafter, and the escape the confinement of the grave. He prayed for peace, wealth, knowledge, prosperity, health, progress, blessings, tranquillity and stability.

Selected Manuscripts of the Shaykh and their Thematic Dimension

The 1950s represented a milestone in the career of Shaykh Aliyu Harazimi as a Sufi writer. From the 1950s to 1983, he was able to produce a number of works on various Sufi subjects. This section examines some of these wirings and some of these themes. Nine manuscripts are discussed here due to their relevance to his thoughts, ideas, views, teachings, and spiritual as well as moral training.
Shaykh Aliyu Harazimi wrote this manuscript in 1967 and it is one of the most celebrated of his corpus. The author introduced the book with the name of Allah and a prayer to the Prophet Muhammad. He quoted Imam Junayd (d. 298 AH/910 CE Baghdad), who was asked regarding the people who stopped to observe any obligatory religious duties, as these were the only means to attain wusuli (arrival), and now they had wasala (arrived). Junayd answered that they are right, they have wasala arrived in hellfire; that is someone who steals and fornicates is better off than someone who claims such. Another Sufi master went further to say I would not stop my wirk (liturgies) if I could live one thousand years. This work was written primarily to challenge the pseudo Tijjaniyya members or any person or group of people who stop observing obligatory religious duties and practices on the pretext that they had reached spiritual perfection. This has been a recurrent problem among the followers of Sufi Shuyukh. The Shaykh wrote this work to admonish those who intend to stop the obligations of the religion on the grounds that they pretend to have attained a high position in the Sufi ranks. According to the Shaykh, they were deviating from the true teachings of Islam and Sufism.

The author also outlined seven conditions for one to be considered as someone who depends and absolutely puts his trust in Allah:

1. He does not require food when feeling hunger.
2. He does not seek medicine when he fell sick.
3. When cheated he does not avenge.
4. He does not cry if cheated.
5. When wrongly ruined or harmed he does not look for help.
6. Whenever tested with menace, wrath, calamity or jeopardy he does not worry.
7. He submitted to Allah and He knows his condition.
Here the author is proffering a better way of spiritual perfection. Instead of the Sufi ending his observance of the Islamic obligatory rituals, he should rather focus on the purification of his heart. A murid (disciple) must demonstrate total reliance on the Creator to the extent that whatever calamity has befallen upon him, he should consider it as a test from his Creator and should not seek revenge from the person who cheated him.

Moreover, the author then continues to suggest ways in which the seeker can further make progress in the path of spiritual perfection. In this regard, he advises the disciples on the importance of good intention when performing religious duty. He urged Muslims to strive and spare extra time for their religious benefit in the hereafter. He also challenges the pseudo Sufis to stop pretending and to work hard to strive to follow the example of the Prophet.

Large section of the work discusses the defects of nafs (ego, soul), qalb (heart) and ruh (spirit). Shaykh Aliyu Harazimi also called the attention of people who perform karamat (miracles/marvels), ajaib (amazing things), or who use their aql (rationale), fada‘il (excellent qualities) and kashf (unveiling) to turn to their Creator Allah.

*Juhudil Ajiz (The Efforts of the Powerless)*

In this 1967 publication, the author treated a lot of issues relating to Sufi concepts such as ma‘arifa (gnosis), kashf (unveiling) and faydah (divine flood). The author acknowledges that Prophets and Sufi Shuyukh do not have power over any person to put him in hellfire or paradise; they are servants of Allah and He chooses them for His favour to be models among people. None of them is considered Allah or shares His attributes. Always the intention of a Muslim should be to worship Allah alone and believe in the sacred message of the Prophet Muhammad. Shaykh Aliyu Harazimi
advised Muslims to associate with any of the Sufi brotherhoods (and not just the Tijaniyya alone).

_Bayan Ma Hawa Ismil Lazi Tasama Da’iratil Ihadati (Explaining the Scope of the Term: Da’iratil Ihadati)_

This 1968 book concerns the secret of the *Haqiqatul Muhammadiyya* (The Reality Essence of Prophet Muhammad) which brings divine manifestation (*tajalla*) on some *Arifun* (Gnostics) such as *Qutb* and with similar spiritual station (*maqamat*). He discussed the meaning of *Da’iratil Ihadati* as the secret of Prophet Muhammad’s name, and its purpose. Furthermore, he explained the name called *Ismul Kabir* (Great Name) of the *Surat al-Fatiha*, which is exclusive secret of high Essence (*dhat*). It contains the secret of *Qudra* (Divine power) and *Irada* (Divine willing).

_Mas’ilati fil Bayan Ismil Lazi Yusama Muntawi (A Brief Account of the Subject: Al-Muntawi)_

This 1968 book discussed the the meaning of *Muntawi* that is pure and according to the author, the name is attributed to the *qalb* (heart) of Prophet Muhammad, which was very clean, pure, refined, and there is nothing in it except Allah. He explained much of the essence of reality and the main theme is the praise of the Prophet Muhammed. The main theme of this work is the praise of the Prophet Muhammad. This is a very dominant theme among the *Sufi* writers.

_Bughuyatul Mishtaqi Li’usuli Sabili ila Ma’arifatillahi Ta’ala (A Path to Gnosis Knowledge)_

This 1983 monograph reemphasized the author’s previous teachings, training and method on Sufism. The text drew the attention of the disciples to the dangerous and serious threat posed by feeling ego, arrogance, deviating from the teachings of the
both the Qur’an and the Sunnah of the Prophet Muhammad, as well as depending on and putting trust in any entity other than the Creator.

The author also discussed the significance of defeating the lower soul by purifying and refining it to turn to Allah. The author was trying to show how a lower soul will become a mirror, which sees its Creator – Mover as home of divine light. Emphasis is also given on the proper conduct (adab) as well as absolute submission to the Will of Allah. In a nutshell, the monograph is devoted to how a disciple of Islam will become a ‘true’ and ‘real’ servant of Allah.

Another important theme in the writing of the Shaykh in the 1960s was the importance of the praise and prayers on the Prophet Muhammad. Sufi teachings emphasize the importance of the fana’i (annihilation in the Prophet) unions with the Prophet as well as entering into his presence (al – hadrat al- Muhammadiyya).19 This resulted in the devotional practices surrounding his personality in the form of sending blessings and prayers (salat alal Naby), as well as panegyrical poetry. This practice is central and cardinal in Sufism generally, and Tijjaniyya devotes greater attention on seeking union and closeness with the Prophet.20

*Sullamul Muhibbina ila Khabaratil Khairil Mursalina (Ladder of the Lover for Entering into the Presence of the Best of Messengers)*

The Shaykh started writing this manuscript in the 1950s but completed it in 1967. This book of *Salawat alal Naby* (Book of Prayer to the Prophet) is a collection of over four hundred different style prayers on the Prophet. Each one illustrated how the author articulated immense longing, love, closeness, affection and his annihilation

20 For detail, see: Valerie J. Hoffman, “Annihilation in the Messenger of God”. 

64
into the Presence of Prophet Muhammad. This book expressed the light, essence as well as the Prophet Muhammad as the origin of the cosmos:

Oh! Allah conveys blessings and peace to the Prophet Muhammad. Oh! Allah convey greetings, peace and blessings to our upright leader, and bless him, our leader Muhammad, when he manifests in the spirit (ruh) of the person he successfully attained the Gnostic knowledge.  

Sirrul Asrar (the Secret of Secrets)

This lengthy 1968 book contains different approaches and styles of prayers to the Prophet Muhammad and has a total of 158 entries. The following are the examples of the prayers:

Oh! Allah, convey peace and blessings to our upright leader Muhammad, the one You (Allah) trained and fulfilled his moral uprightnss. You made his behavior to be the reflection of the Glorious Qur’an. Give me, and my children, a fraction of his moral uprightnss for the sake of the blessings in the prayer to our leader Muhammad O Wahhabu O Mu’udi.  

Sirril Al-Masuni (The Hidden Secret)

This 1968 book also contains different styles of prayers to the Prophet Muhammad. However, this book is smaller than the aforementioned, and contains only 39 entries. The following are examples of the prayers:

Oh! Allah conveys peace and blessings to whom none can offer prayer except the One You (Allah) destined to pray for him, with his family. May this prayer be equal to his immense position and grandeur.

21 For this prayer, see: Sullumul Muhibbin, (lithographed in Kano, no publisher, 2008.), p.18.  
22 For this prayer see: Sirril Asrar, p. 267, and Sullumul Muhibbin, pp. 157-158.
Oh! Allah convey peace and blessings to he who none knew him except Allah, with his family. May this prayer be equal to his immense position and grandeur.

Oh! Allah conveys peace and blessings to the Perfect Man with his family. May this prayer be equal to his immense position and grandeur.23

*Khaba’ul Hawa’ij (Acceptance of Prayer)*

This 1969 publication contains 65 prayers to the Prophet Muhammad. The examples are as follows:

Oh! Allah conveys your blessings to Muhammad, for his blessings raise me in his company in the Day of Judgment.

Oh! Allah sends your blessings to Muhammad, for this prayer link me up with him.

Oh! Allah sends your blessings to Muhammad, like how he adhered to Your (Allah) commands.24

It is very important to note that the Shaykh had dozens of prayers written on pamphlets circulating within the circle of his disciples –both Tijjaniyya members as well as non-Tijjaniyya folk. These prayers become part of their daily ritual and Prophetic devotional practices.

**Conclusion**

*Shaykh* Aliyu Harazimi made a significant intellectual contribution towards the production of important manuscripts on aspects of Islam, Sufism, as well as Tijjaniyya *Tariqa*. The works needs to be published by a competent and professional company for the benefit of Islamic students, historians, researchers and the general

---

23 Refers to *Siril al Masuni*, pp. 357, 358, 359.
public. He was among the Tijaniyya Faydah network in Kano who contributed to the revival of Islamic literature production. This paper revealed that his available manuscript works were produced from the early 1950s to the early 1980s. His corpus testifies to his immense love of the Prophet, spiritual annihilation, and also exposed his approach and thought as a traditional scholar with high regards to following the path of the Prophet. There is an urgent need to garner his scattered manuscript works and digitalize them for proper documentation and preservation. This list of his manuscripts can be regarded as tentative until all the works are compiled, and it agreed upon by his close associates.
**Bibliography**

**Oral Interviews**

Diso Mustapha Aliyu, a Tijjaniyya *muqaddam* and author of many works, 4/11/2012. Harazimi Aliyu Tijjani Ahmad, a *Khalifa* from 2013 to date.

**Texts**


Appendix

List and Chronology of Shaykh Aliyu Harazimi Manuscripts


2. *Da’irat Jamali* (Precisely authored it in 1965, this manuscript has no date, but it seems that he wrote it around 1965 because it also demonstrates his annihilation in the Light of the Essence of Prophet Muhammad. It was in the early 60s that he was observed (*Istigraq*) into the presence of the Prophet (*al hadratul al-Muhammadiyya*).


5. *Bayan Ma Hawa Ismil Lazi Tasama Da’iratil Ihadati* (1968) (Explaining the Scope of the Term: *Da’iratil Ihadati*).


17. *Kitabu al-Tahmid* (1969) (Book of gratitude to Allah). The above listed works were lithographed in Kano by local press and are of two volumes.


20. Al-Fasal Bayan Ismihi Ta’ala wa Ismihi Rahmanu wa Kulli Mustaqilli bil Martabati (1971) (Explanation of the Names: Ta’ala and Rahamanu)


22. Salatul Wahdiyya (1971) (Book of Prayer to the Holy Prophet)
Fiqh Al-Aqalliyyah Between Texts and Neo-Ijtihad in Modern Legal Studies: A Case Study of Igbo Muslim Minorities

Kazeem Adekunle Adegoke

Dr Adegoke is a specialist of Islamic Legal Studies at the Department of Religious Studies (Islamic Studies Unit), University of Lagos, Nigeria, holding a Ph.D. in Islamic Studies from the University of Ilorin. For over twenty years, he has conducted research into Islamic Legal Studies in the areas of Islamic Law and Jurisprudence, Neo-Ijtihad and Contemporary Fiqh, and mentored more than fifty students at undergraduate and postgraduate levels. He is a member of several professional and academic bodies such as the Nigerian Association of Arabic and Islamic Studies, the Nigerian Association for the Study of Religions, the National Association for the Study of Religions and Education, and the African Association for the Study of Religions. He has published over fifty papers in local and international academic journals.

Abstract: This study researches interplay between the Islamic Fiqh Al-Aqalliyyah legal theory with Muslim minorities in a non-Muslim majority community, drawing from the Igbo community as a case study. This paper examines the Fiqh Al-Aqalliyyah, its legal position in Islamic jurisprudence and its effectiveness in the security of the Muslim minorities’ rights and privileges under the sovereignty of non-Muslim majority community. Research method used in this study is expository, descriptive, analytical and critical in order to showcase applicability within the selected context-specific and need-based neo-Ijtihād among the Igbo Muslim minorities in the modern legal theory. Conclusively, the paper makes findings that Islamic jurisprudence (Fiqh) as a legal theory is naturally dynamic to meet up to the occasional and circumstantial demand and need of time. Finally, the paper recommends that Islamic legal theorists (‘Uṣuliyyūn) and jurists (Fuqahā’) should create public awareness of Fiqh al-Aqalliyyah among the contemporary Muslims and that Islamic legal theorist and jurists should consider multiple contemporary jurisprudential issues

Introduction

The growth and development of Islam in modern Nigeria took another dimension when the religion spread to Igbo land in the nineteenth century. Islam arrived late to the area despite the fact that Islam was present in the northern part of the country since the eleventh century. In the Kanem-Borno Empire, Islam was recognised as the
official religion during the reign of Mai Umme Jilmi who reigned between 1085 and 1097. From there, Islam later spread to Hausaland in the earlier fourteenth century, and by the end of eighteenth century, the faith spread to the other parts of the country with the exception of Igbo land.¹ Popular encounter with Islam in Igbo land was accidental because early Muslim settlers were some Hausa-Fulanis and Yorubas who settled in the area for commercial purpose alone. It is not out of tune to state that some of these settlers were neither professionally-trained as Islamic clerics nor have ability to communicate in the Igbo native language.² As a result of this, they could not do much in the missionary activities of Islam in the area. The breakthrough was later achieved in Igbo land through the missionary effort of few Hausa-Fulanis, Yorubas and Igbo indigenous Muslims (the majority of whom were the children of the first generation of Muslim converts) in the twentieth century. Despite this fact, the population of Igbo Muslims in the Igbo community are still negligible in comparable to other non-Islamic religious groups in the area for reasons ranging from social, cultural and religious.

As a minority group in the Igbo land, Igbo Muslims faced challenges and difficulties in their private and public lives in their multi-religious community which have adverse effects on conversion to the present era. For instance, the ‘EndSARS’³ mass protests embarked upon by Nigerian youth across the country in October 2020, assumed another dimension in the Igbo community as protesters attacked some Muslims and their mosques in the area.⁴ The germane question is to what extent has

³ EndSARS Protest is a mass protest organized by Nigerian youth to put a stop to one arm of Police called Special Anti-Robbery Squad (Police brutality) in the country. This protest took place between 12 and 23, October 2020.
⁴ Some mosques in Orlu, Enugu and other areas were attacked by some EndSARS protesters and Muslims were killed, several others were severely injured, and their properties were either looted or destroyed.
Islam impacted on Igbo non-Muslim minorities? What effort has Muslim legal theorists exerted to lessen the anxiety of the challenges and difficulties faced by the Igbo non-Muslim minorities in their non-Muslim majority areas? What may be the future of Islam in the Igbo community if the jurisprudential issues are carefully and technically handled within the legal rulings of Islamic jurisprudence of minority (Fiqh Al-Aqalliyyah)? It is on this line that the paper wishes to examine Fiqh Al-Aqalliyyah, its legal position within Islamic jurisprudence and its effectiveness in the security of the rights and privileges of Muslim minorities under the sovereignty of non-Muslim majority community, taking Igbo non-Muslim majority community as case study. The purpose is to showcase the dynamism of modern day Islamic jurisprudence (Fiqh Al-Mu‘assirah) in the modern age through the exploration of neo-Ijtihād which is premised on context-specific and need-based circumstances.

**Conceptualizing the Fiqh Al-Aqalliyyah and Neo-Ijtihād**

*Fiqh Al-Aqalliyyah* is a combination of two words namely ‘Fiqh’ and ‘Aqalliyyah’. The term “Fiqh” is an Arabic word emerged from the root verb “Faquha” which means he knew, understood. *Fiqh* literally means science, knowledge or understanding. Technically, it means the science which deals with the sources of Islamic law and the method by which the law is derived and the philosophy underlying it.5 In short, *Fiqh* is a science of practical legal rules as obtained from their peculiar sources. The term ‘Aqalliyyah’ is derived from Arabic weak verb ‘Qalla’ which linguistically means ‘he became small, little, few or less significant in number or quantity’.6 Thus, *Aqalliyyah* literally means smaller number, numerical inferiority and minority.7 Technically, *Aqalliyyah* could be defined as a group of people who are of different race or faith to most of the people in the same community or country

where they reside.\textsuperscript{8} With this understanding, \textit{Fiqh Al-Aqalliyyah} simply means Islamic jurisprudence of minority. In the context of this study, \textit{Fiqh Al-Aqalliyyah} is referring to neo-\textit{Ijtihād} based Islamic jurisprudence of Muslim minorities residing in a non-Muslim community. \textit{Fiqh Al-Aqalliyyah} is one of the modern developments in Islamic jurisprudence which has been thoroughly discussed through the lens of neo-\textit{Ijtihād} exercised in the light of circumstantial, occasional and situational-based Islamic jurisprudence (\textit{Fiqh Al-Waqi'}).\textsuperscript{9} This is the reason why \textit{Fiqh Al-Aqalliyyah}, in the contemporary time, became a hot-debated and controversial issue in Islamic jurisprudence among the conservative and contemporary jurists (\textit{Fuqahā’}) and legal theorists (\textit{Usūliyūn}).

**Advent of Islam in the Igbo community**

South-Eastern Nigeria which is Igbo community area came into being during the year of amalgamation of Northern and Southern Provinces in 1914 by the then Governor-General, Sir Lord Fredrick Lugard. The country was named ‘Nigeria’, the name which was coined out of ‘Niger area’ by his wife, Lady Flora Lugard in the same year. This Igbo community is presently the collective name for the five states of Igbo community namely Abia, Anambra, Ebonyi, Enugu and Imo. The Igbo people retain a long-held status as the dominant ethnic group in this part of Nigeria, and they represent one-quarter of Nigeria’s population. Igbo people, before the advent of Islam were the adherents of African Traditional Religion, later, some of them accepted Christianity during the British colonial era towards the end of nineteenth century.\textsuperscript{10}

Islam was introduced into Igbo community during the 1890s in a friendly atmosphere of peaceful interactions, through some Muslim migrants from the Northern Nigeria.

(Hausa-Fulani tribes) and South-western Nigeria (Yoruba) who came to the area for commercial purposes. By 1958, Igbo Muslim communities were found in Enohia or Afikpo and Owerri. Enohia had largest Igbo Muslim congregation in the Igbo community through the Islamisation of some Igbo quarters by one Okpani Egwuani Nwagui, who was later re-named as Ibrahim Niasse Nwagui after his conversion to Islam from Christianity. He accepted Islam from Shaykh Ibrahim Niasse (a renowned Tijaniyyah leader in West Africa) at Khawlaq in Senegal and that was the reason why he was christened with his name. On his return to Afikpo from Senegal, Nwagui began the preaching tour of Islam to some hinterland areas in Igbo community through which he converted many Igbo people to Islam. Apart from his local missionary tour, Alhaj Shaykh Ibrahim Niasse Nwagui also toured extensively the Middle Eastern countries in order to get financial assistance for his missionary activities and to establish Islamic Centre. He single-handedly established an Islamic Centre (Islamiyyah school) in 1958 in his hometown where he imparted Islamic education on his children and the children of neighbouring Muslims. The centre was financially and administratively taken-over in 1982 by the Muslim World League (MWL). The role played by one Yoruba Civil Engineer popularly called Engineer Badruddin who hailed from Abeokuta in the present Ogun state of Nigeria, in the spread of Islam in Igbo land cannot be under-emphasized. This man settled in Afikpo in the 1930s from where he constructed some roads and bridges across Igbo land. He and other Yoruba Muslims in Enugu jointly built the Enugu Central Mosque in 1932.

To the average Igbo folk, Islam was erroneously believed to be mainly the traditional faith of the Hausa-Fulani in Northern Nigeria. Despite this dramatic belief, the Nigerian Civil War (Nigeria-Biafra War) which took place between 1967 and 1970

---

could not obliterate the impact of Islam in the area, even though some mosques were destroyed by some aggrieved Biafran soldiers who erroneously gave religious intonation to that war.\textsuperscript{14} Those aggrieved Biafra soldiers alleged the Igbo Muslims were traitors as a result of their Islamic faith. More Igbo people were converted to Islam during the post-civil war as there was severe starvation and deprivation which gave some foreign Islamic supporting institutions an opportunity to offer humanitarian services. Presently, Islamic oriented schools, ranging from Nursery, Primary and Secondary schools exist today at Enohia, Enugu and Orlu through the financial support of some international Islamic institutions such as the Muslim World League in Saudi Arabia.\textsuperscript{15}

\textit{Fiqh Al-Aqalliyyah in context-specific and need-based neo-Ijtihād among Igbo Muslim minorities}

\textit{Lawful and Unlawful Meat}

In the Igbo community, the slaughter of animals (cow, goat, pig and dog) and fowls (chicken and turkey) for human consumption is undertaken either in an abattoir or municipal slaughter slab in the community. Beef, mutton, pork and chicken are the most popular in any of the five states of Igbo community, with dog meat provide an alternative source of animal protein requirements for the Igbos.\textsuperscript{16} There are some areas in the Igbo community where the pork and dog meats constitute major sources of protein for the populace and are easily available in almost all abattoirs, local markets, super markets, food canteens, restaurant and hotels. Muslim minorities in some districts of Igbo community used to face serious challenges in getting halal meat for consumption since Islamic laws have serious guidelines. In general, sources of

protein from beef, goat and chicken are lawful while that of pork and dog meat are unlawful.

The bone of contention is that the *halal* slaughtering of goat, sheep, ram and fowls need to be verified by Muslims. In many municipal abattoirs, there is no discrimination in the slaughtering process of the *halal* and non-*halal* animals together by non-Muslim butchers in the same abattoirs with the same slaughtering devices. This verification may be very challenging if these sources of protein are purchased as already-prepared meat in small quantities from community markets and so forth. This is where the *Fiqh Al-Aqalliyyah* comes in to soften the problem and challenge of Muslim minorities in the Igbo community which is dominated by non-Muslims. In the *Fiqh Al-Aqalliyyah*, it is legally-permissible for Muslim minorities in a non-Muslim society in such circumstances to take the meat of those legally-permissible animals slaughtered by non-Muslim butchers, even if it is obvious that they do not subscribe to the slaughtering guidelines in Islamic jurisprudence (*Fiqh*). What the concerned Muslim minorities need to do is to just utter *Basmallah* (*Bismillah*) at the time of eating such a meat. It was related from ‘A’ishah Bint Abu Bakr (R.A) who reported in *Ṣaḥīḥ Al-Bukhārī* that some Muslims came to the Prophet (S.A.W) and told him that:

Some people used to present us some meat of which we are not sure of whether the name of Allah was invoked or not at the time of slaughtering, could we ate from such meat? The Prophet (S.A.W) simply said; “Just say ‘Bismillah’ and eat it.”

Similarly, it is also legally-permissible for Muslim minorities in the same environments to take common legally-impermissible animals in some environments in the Igbo community such as pork and dog where it is very difficult to get legally-permissible animals for consumption or in the case of necessity in order to lessen the

---

burden of Muslim minorities from accessibility to the only available source of protein.

This precept is guided by the concluding portion of Qur’ān 2:173 that:

فمن اضطر غير باغ ولا عاد فلا إثما عليه إن الله غفور رحيم

But he who is driven by necessity, neither craving nor transgressing, there is no blame on him. Indeed Allah is Forgiving, Merciful.

There are some legal maxims which are also in support of this when they point out that:

الضرورات تبيح المحظورات

Necessity renders prohibited matters permissible

In the general jurisprudential rule (Fiqh), pork is regarded as legally impermissible animals for Muslim. This is also evidenced in the Qur’an 2:173 which states:

إذا حرم عليكم الميتة والدم ولحم الخنزير وما أهل به لغير الله

He (Allah) has forbidden you only carrion, blood, pork and that which is consecrated in the name of any other than Allah…

The same jurisprudential rule is applicable to dog as one of carnivorous animals. All carnivorous animals, wild or domesticated, are legally impermissible because they possess fangs. In a Ḥadīth reported by ‘Abdullah Ibn ‘Abbas:

Prophet (S.A.W) forbade all carnivorous animals which have fangs and all birds that have talons.18

What the Muslim minorities in the non-Muslim majority environment must aim towards, is to keep only the necessitated amount and quantity needed for their survival at that moment or period.19

18 Al-Muslim, M. H. Q. N. nd. Šahīb Al-Muslim. (Istanbul: np, Hadith 1934.)
Marriage with Non-Muslims

Marriage is seen as a form of worship in Islamic legal system. The Muslim family system could be legally established through a properly-conducted marriage contract (‘Aqdu’n-Nikāḥ) which will consequently lead to procreation of legitimate descendants. In Islamic marriage, religious preference is given ultimate consideration in Islamic legal system as a result of Quran 2:222 which claims:

And do not marry the idolatresses until they believe, and certainly a believing maid is better than an idolatress woman, even though she should please you; and do not give (believing women) in marriage to idolaters until they believe, and certainly a believing servant is better than an idolater, even though he should please you; these invite to the fire, and Allah invites to the garden and to forgiveness by His will, and makes clear His communications to men, that they may be mindful.

However, in Islamic legal system, it is legally permissible for male Muslims to marry female non-Muslim among the people of book (Ahlu’l-Kitāb). These are the Jews and Christians, since they believe in God, follow a prophet and possess a heavenly-revealed scripture. Qur’ān 5:6 buttresses this fact when it reads:

أَلِيَّمُ أَحْلُ لَكُمُ الطُّبِيَّاتِ وَطَعَامُ أَنْتَنِي أَوْتُوُ الْكِتَابِ حَلَّ لَهُنَّ وَالْمُحْصَنَاتُ مِنَ الْمُؤْمِنَاتِ وَالْمُحْصَنَاتُ مِنَ الْذَّيْنَ أَوْتُوُ الْكِتَابِ مِن قَبْلَهُمَّ إِذَا أَتَتُمُّنَّ أَجُورَهُنَّ مَحْصُونَ عِندَ رَبِّهِمْ وَمَتَّعَهَا أَخْدَانَ

Likewise, lawful to you are believing chaste women in wedlock, and in welcome chaste women of them who were given the Book before you if you give them their due dowers and desire chastity, in wedlock and not in licence or as taking secret lovers.

The inter-marriage between male Muslims and chaste women of people of book is legally permissible within the context-specific and need-based neo-Ijtihād with the understanding that:\(^\text{21}\)

i. such a Muslim husband will be able to fully exercise family control as instrumental leader, head of family and manager (Qawwām) who is responsible for the upbringing the family members in his own Islamic faith.

ii. it may serve as a gesture of good will toward non-Muslims that Islam is a religion of tolerance.

iii. female Muslims are neither available nor accessible.

iv. it may serve as an avenue to showcase the true principles of Islam in a favourable encounter to non-Muslim.

There are various non-Muslim faith groups in all the five states in Igbo community- namely Christians (who are in the majority), African Traditionalists and Atheists. This is the reason why some of these states claim that they are Christian states. With this understanding, female Christians are the only non-Muslims in those areas that Muslims are legally permissible to take to altar since they believe in Almighty God, follow a prophet and possess a heavenly-revealed scripture. In accordance with account of Uchendu, the large of the Muslims in the Igbo community are Muslims of

---

second generation, that is to say, that they are children of the first generation of the Muslims in the area.\textsuperscript{22}

Presently, the male South-easterners who converted into Islam far out-number the female counterparts. Even so, the available few female South-easterners who embraced Islam did so because of their marriage with male Igbo Muslims. In such a situation, it is legally-discouraged for the male South-eastern Muslims who wish to move into polygyny to marry another female Muslims as this action would hinder their fellow Muslims who are still bachelors from marrying them as they are very few in comparison to their male counterparts. As a result of this, there are some Igbo Muslims who marry up to four wives from the non-Muslim daughters, widows and divorcee who are previously adherents of either Christianity or African Traditional Religion and converted them to Islam so as to increase the population of Muslims in the area.\textsuperscript{23}

Those who engaged in this type of marriage are legally covered in \textit{Fiqh al-Aqaliyyah} within the context-specific and need-based neo-\textit{Ijtihād}. However, \textit{permissibility of marriage with non-Muslims should not be extended to the legal rulings on divorce and inheritance particularly in a situation where the Muslim dies and his non-Muslim wife with under-aged children have not embraced Islam as \textit{Sharī’ah} has taken care of that through \textit{Wasīyyah} (Bequest) since they are not entitled to original inheritance.\textsuperscript{23}

\textit{Political Participation}

In some respects, the religo-political system in a non-Islamic society may be a microcosm of the ideal Islamic state operated by the first generation of Muslims in the seventh century through which Prophet Muḥammad fraternized with various races and


colours under one umbrella of Islam. To some Islamic political activists like Ḥasan Al-Banna\textsuperscript{24} and Abu’l A‘lā Al-Mawdūdī,\textsuperscript{25} Islam is a total and comprehensive way of life, as stipulated in the Qur’ān and the Sunnah of the Prophet Muḥammad, as a blueprint (\textit{Athār}) of the first generation of Muslims. In contemporary theocratic systems of Islam, secular ideas, beliefs, values, and indeed political ideologies, are condemned, while ‘modernizing’ political ideology is not, however. Modernizing political ideology is accepted in as much as it is perceived to be compliant with Islamic beliefs and values so as to safeguard against the penetration of non-Islamic values and an extreme dependence on them.\textsuperscript{26} In getting the public office holders to the position of authority, Islamic political systems favour \textit{Shurā}-based representation which was showcased by the Prophet and the rightly-guided caliphs who ruled between 632 CE and 661 CE – wherein the people of authority see themselves as Allah’s representatives and trustees of the public office.\textsuperscript{27}

Unlike an ideal Islamic political system, the Igbo community is a multi-religious society governed by a democratic, Federal Republic of Nigeria which constitutionally gives room to the existence of several political parties. Just like the whole Federal Republic of Nigeria, the type of governance running in each of the five states in the Igbo community is based on democracy through which the common people elect their representatives to govern their community. Unlike democracy where the power of decision making, control and governance belongs to the masses who are in majority in the government, \textit{Shurā} representative postulates that power of decision making, control and governance belong to Allah and His Prophet as it were indicated in the

\textsuperscript{25} Mawdudi, A. A. \textit{Islamic Way of Life}, (United Kingdom: The Islamic Foundation, 1986), p.29.
\textsuperscript{27} Adegoke, K. A. ‘\textit{Shurah Institution within the Framework of Shari‘ah and its Relevance to Islamic Polity}’, in \textit{Al-Fikr, the Journal of Arabic and Islamic Studies}, (University of Ibadan, 2008), Volume 20, pp.31-32.
Qur’an and the Sunnah respectively where an idealized form of Islamic theo-political system is interpreted by a ruling body of clerics (Majlis ash-Shurā).

As a minority group in Igbo community, Igbo Muslims are legally-permissible to participate in the liberal democratic political dispensation if their circumstantial and situational affairs in the environment fall within the context-specific and need-based necessity which calls for a relative neo-Ijtiḥād. This legal permission is granted to the Igbo Muslims through the aid of Fiqh Al-Aqalliyyah if their alienation from politics would:

i. render them redundant and hamper them from taking part in the public administration of the area.

ii. expose them to social insecurity, social oppression and unnecessary marginalization from non-Muslim majorities in the area.

iii. subject them to the servitude of non-Muslims in the area.

This legal permission is clearly expressed in public interest (Maṣlaḥah) and legal maxims (Qawā’idu’l-Fiṣḥiyyah) in Islamic legal corpus. Some of these legal maxims are as follows:

ما جاز لعذر بطل بزواله

“What becomes legal by a valid excuse, will become illegal when the excuse ends.”

الحاجة تنزل الضرورة عامة كانت أو خاصة

“General or particular need can develop into necessity.”

إذا تعذر الأصل يصار إلى البديل

28 Mishkat, Al-Qawā'idu’l-Fiṣḥiyyah (Legal Maxims of Islamic Jurisprudence), a Translated Compilation, Islamic University of North America (Mishkah)( Islamic Studies English Program, 2013), pp.92-100.
“When the fundamental something is not available, we proceed to alternative.”

However, it cannot be ruled out that it is not legally-permissible for conscious Muslims to take part in a venture such as liberal democracy which seeks to legitimize the sovereignty of masses in the position of authority in the decision making of a government at the expense of Allah. In Islam, the sovereignty of the masses as clearly demonstrated in liberal democracy may be interpreted to contradict the sovereignty of Allah, for all men are equal in front of God because humans are all created equal and any system that denies that equality is not Islamic as stipulated in the Qur’an 63:8 which reads:29

وَللهِ العَزَّةُ وَلِرَسُولِهِ وَلِلْمُؤْمِنِينَ

“Sovereignty belongs to Allah and to His Messenger and to the believers.”

**Conclusion**

This paper examined the *Fiqh Al-Aqaliyyah*, its legal position in Islamic jurisprudence and its effectiveness in the security of the Muslim minorities’ rights and privileges under the sovereignty of non-Muslim majority community with a special reference to Igbo community, popularly referred to Igbo land. Conclusively, the paper observes that:

i. Islamic jurisprudence (*Fiqh*) as a legal theory is naturally dynamic to meet up to the occasional and circumstantial demand and need of the time.

ii. *Fiqh Al-Aqaliyyah* is not an independent legal theory and it can only be employed through neo-*Ijtihād* in the modern legal studies when there is context-specific and need-based jurisprudential issue.

iii. that Muslim minorities in the contemporary period through the proper application of *Fiqh al-Aqalliyyah* can derive their own context-specific and need-based legal rulings in times of hardship and necessity in order to lessen

---

the physical, social, financial and emotional hardships or difficulties faced by
them in an unfamiliar non-Muslim majority community.

The study, therefore, recommends that:

i. Islamic legal theorist and jurists should create the public awareness among the
contemporary Muslims that *Fiqh al-Aqalliyyah* legal rule cannot be given
general application when there is no reason for it.

ii. Islamic legal theorist and jurists should consider several contemporary
jurisprudential issues and provide appropriate legal rulings through the
context-specific and need-based *Fiqh Al-Aqalliyyah*. 
References


Mishkat, Al-Qawā‘idu’l-Fiqhyyah (Legal Maxims of Islamic Jurisprudence), a Translated Compilation, (Islamic University of North America, Islamic Studies English Program, 2013).


Phone Interview with Isa Okonkwo, a Public Relations Officer of Supreme Council of Islamic Affairs, Nigeria on 9, October 2020.